

## Promoting Students' Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS) through Classroom English Debate in Critical Speaking Course at IAIN Bone Students

Muhammad Zuhri DJ<sup>1</sup>, Musfirah<sup>2</sup>

<sup>12</sup>Institut Agama Islam Negeri (IAIN) Bone

Corresponding Author: [zuhristaindije@gmail.com](mailto:zuhristaindije@gmail.com)

**ABSTRACT.** The analyzing, evaluating, and creating skills that were drilled during debate practice have been shown to support Students' critical thinking skills. It proved how debate inspires Students to analyze a situation from their point of view, depth of thought, scope of perspective, and accuracy of conclusion. This research, therefore, aimed to evaluate the debate in promoting Students' higher-order thinking skills, particularly among Students of the English Education Program at IAIN Bone, South Sulawesi. The research adopted qualitative analysis, using observation and interviews as data-gathering instruments. The findings showed that debate promoted Students' higher-order thinking skills because in debating, Students are required to think critically according to aspects of Bloom's taxonomy; they were analyzing, evaluating, and creating. However, there were several problems faced by some Students in English debate classrooms in critical speaking subjects, namely trouble defining the motion, a limited vocabulary, difficulty rebutting the opponent's argument, difficulty expressing an argument, and being nervous when practicing debates because they have to think critically. Based on the findings, debate activity contributed to sharpening their higher-order thinking skill, such as analyzing, evaluating, and creating skills.

**Keywords:** *Debate, Higher Order Thinking Skill, Critical Speaking, Students' Problem.*

### A. INTRODUCTION

Higher thinking skills are needed to solve problems that arise in everyday life. The importance of higher-order thinking skills in this globalization era requires critical, creative, logical, and rational thinking by a community for screening. All the information obtained can solve the internal problems of life. Schools are challenged to find ways to enable Students to thrive in work and life by mastering creative thinking, flexible problem solving, collaboration and innovation. Indicators of success are based more on the ability to communicate, share, and use information to solve complex problems, be able to adapt and innovate in response to new demands and changing circumstances, and expand the power of technology to create new knowledge.

In current curriculum, Educators should lead learning that encourages Students to think critically and have high-level thinking skill (HOTS). (Anderson et al., 2001) High Order thinking

skill is analyzing, evaluating, and creating processes. The role of educational strategies plays an important role in which Students can create, interpret, analyze, reason, synthesize and evaluate. Teaching encourages conceptual change in Students, not just giving justification of information but will be facilitated by interactive discourse during lessons and activity. A clear explanation from the teacher is important, as is the ability of Students to answer questions and discuss or argue implications or applications in authentic problem solving or decision making. Instructional strategies are important in the context of the higher education sequence of cultivating thinking skill.

Debating is a strategy that can improve Students' critical thinking. In the debate, each student is invited to critically analyse a problem. The debate used more effective features than any other debate – Students experienced the principles actually discussed – respect, empathy, tolerance and what happen when these are lacking. (Harefa & Ndruru, 2022) The students gain the ability to generate ideas, formulate thoughts, express opinions, and react to those of others. Additionally, individuals can learn to recognize the "schema" or plan of various speaking styles and evaluate their own speaking as they are producing it. Teacher involves in creating students' participation during learning by playing an important role in students' conceptual interpretation, analytical skill and problem-solving ability and in the reconstruction of thinking. HOTS requires the analysis and derivation of a fact, not just the repetition of the facts. It means, HOTS goes far beyond memorization, which is the primary goal of training. However, the researchers observed that the teacher tends to facilitate the task in the summative assessment like the final exam. Meanwhile, the promotion activity of HOTS is still weak. Debating makes it easier for Students to experience the practice of higher-order thinking by seeing different perspectives, and also tries to encourage them to think critically, quickly, and wisely. Debating practice tends to drill the analysis and evaluation skill which proven that it accommodates the Students' critical thinking skill. It supports how debate encourages Students to appraise a situation based on their own opinion. (Camp & Schnader, 2010) conducted research upon debate practice in classroom to enhance critical thinking presented similar findings. There is a significant improvement in Students' critical thinking skill given the way Students were able to assess their skill after the debate activity and most Students were satisfied with the activity and she felt helped. Therefore, the researchers are intended to conduct research, how classroom English debate can promote the Students' High Order thinking skill.

## **B. REVIEW OF LITERATURE**

### 1. Higher Order thinking skill

HOTS (Higher Order Thinking Skill) is an educational reform concept based on Bloom's Taxonomy that began in the early 21st century. (Churches, 2008) This concept was introduced in education to prepare for the industrial revolution. Schools are a difficult task to find ways to succeed in work and housing, master creative thinking skill, flexible problems, cooperation and novelty. Successful indicators based on the ability to communicate, share and use, can be changed to meet new demands and dynamic situations and expand technological ability to create new knowledge.

Knowledge of higher order thinking skill not only understands the problems to solve the problem, but also the ability to explore different information to solve problems. Difficulty high order is the process of thinking at the highest cognitive level, created from various cognitive ideas and methods and classification of learning, somewhere -methods to solve problems, classification of blue and classification of learning and evaluation. Hots is closely related to critical thinking. Critical thinking skill is a basic skill in all aspects of life (including education). Critical thinking can be used in various fields of study. Therefore, it is very important that Students are trained in critical thinking; it is a bridge between the problems in the classroom and the problems that exist in the real world. (Rosyid & Hidayati, 2019) critical thinking is a way to see the problems from different perspectives as they do not know whether they belong to pro or cons group in the debate session.

### 2. Critical Thinking

Critical Thinking is a kind of thinking in which you question, analyze, interpret, evaluate and make a judgement about what you hear, read, say, or write. in order to develop critical thinking skill, people must discover how to Clarify the context and aim of your thought, identify arguments and challenge your sources of information, analyse arguments and sources, evaluate other people's arguments while developing or synthesizing your own. Critical thinking skill are one of the demands of new skill needed by Students in the current era (Wenno et al., 2021). The process of evaluating a case, problem, or phenomenon with a complicated notion and analysis to reach a decision and make a reasonable judgment can be summarized as critical thinking. In a variety of contexts, critical thinkers apply this skill effectively, unprompted, and

typically with conscious intention. To put it another way, when someone thinks critically, they assess the results of their thought processes, determine the quality of a decision, or determine how successfully an issue has been solved (Alsaleh, 2020).

### 3. Debate

Debate is a communication process in which participants argue for and against a given topic. Debate is about developing our communication skill. It is about assembling and organizing effective arguments, persuading and entertaining an audience, and using your voice and gestures to convince the adjudicator that our argument outweighs our position. Debate is not about personal abuse, irrational attacks or purely emotional appeals. Debate includes the building of ideas and discussion with deep analysis. The activity tends to ask the participant to give every possibilities of a case, however it also demands deep analysis to strengthen the possibility (Tiasadi, 2020). Debate is way to make Students can think critical about the problems.

### 4. Relation Between Debate Practice and higher order thinking skill or Critical Thinking

A good person can sometimes be seen from how he behaves acts and of course also communicates in the community. It can be seen how this person is able to provide arguments in debates with evidence, critical thinking that can be understood and make sense. We can improve our debate and critical thinking by understanding the nuances of each concept and then aligning them together. Debate is the art of taking a position on an issue and discussing it with someone who has opposing views. This can be useful in exposing the public to various thoughts and opinions. Critical thinking is the ability to analyze a problem scientifically by considering evidence, statistics, data, and other relevant information. It should be objective and impartial, without the influence of personal feelings and beliefs. Debate and thinking critically is very relevant in a debate forum to solve the problem object in an event. Aiming to be a tool in a forum, an environment to improve one's communication skill, this can encourage someone to get used to expressing opinions well, think critically, creatively, analytically, objectively, constructively, impartially and able to be sporty. This is very necessary in a debate.

## **C. METHOD**

### **Respondents**

The subject of the research was TBI 3 of Students of IAIN Bone who took critical speaking subject. The location of this research conducted at IAIN Bone, Bone Regency, South Sulawesi,

Indonesia. This research is qualitative method. According to Denzin and Lincoln in Thomas and Bryan (2011, p. 18) qualitative research is the critical site where theory, method, praxis, action, and policy all come together. The researchers in this qualitative case study investigated how classroom English debate promotes Students' higher order thinking skill as well as Students' difficulties with practicing debate.

### **Instrument**

Interview and observation served as the research's primary data sources. The researchers watched the teaching and learning of English in the classroom and the Students were interviewed. The utilization of interviews as a crucial research tool allowed for the collection of more thorough and detailed data for Students' higher order thinking skill (HOTS) and the problem faced during debate.

### **Procedure**

#### a. Observation

Gay (2006) stated that without changing or modifying anything, observation focuses on comprehending the natural environment as it is experienced by people. In order to get the data, the researchers observed English-language classroom debates during the teaching and learning process to pinpoint the issue. The researchers attentively observed and monitored the teaching-learning process and gathered data from the outcomes of the actions. The researchers developed an observation paper to learn about the classroom environment, after which they assessed the findings and the issues the students encountered during arguing practice.

#### b. Interview

Ary (2010, p. 438), In order to collect information from people about their beliefs, feelings, and opinions on circumstances or conditions in their own words, interviews were used because the researchers utilized a list of questions and additional questions to add data and complete the topic, it was used a semi-structured interview technique for this research.

### **Data Analysis**

The researchers analyzed the data based on research questions.

Miles and Huberman's qualitative data analysis from Keith F. Punch (2009:179) is appropriate for this research. The major elements of their analysis are data reduction, data display, and verification data. The methodology was popularly known as "transcendental realism".

**D. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

The data of observation when Students debated in classroom as follows:

No	Aspect of HOTS	Descriptions of Indicators	Yes	No
1.	C4 Analyzing	- Students are able to analyze the problems contained in the topic.	✓	
		- Students relate the topic of the debate to the experience.	✓	
		- Students are able to present an argument.	✓	
		- Students are able to maintain arguments in the form of facts and examples that are relevant to the topic.	✓	
		- Students are able to describe, detail information to understand knowledge.	✓	
		- Students are able to conclude the knowledge.	✓	
2.	C5 Evaluating	- Students are able to critique the arguments.	✓	
		- Students are able to evaluate information and able to solve problems by giving examples.	✓	
		- Students are able to the defend their opinion.	✓	
		- Students are able to compare the arguments.	✓	

		- Students are able to prove the arguments by giving examples.	✓	
3.	C6 Creating	- Students are able to develop opinion.	✓	
		- Students are able to create brilliant idea relate knowledge.		✓
		- Students are able to integrate arguments.	✓	
		- Students are able to think creatively.		✓

Based on the observation when Students practiced English debate in classroom, in aspect of analyzing. According to Anderson and Krathwohl (2001), "analyzing" is the process of looking into data from many sources. Students are able to analyze the problems contained in the topic, to relate the topic to the experience, to present an argument in the form of facts and give example that are relevant to the topic, to describe the information and conclude the knowledge. To entail students use their own judgment to begin analyzing the knowledge they have learnt. At this point, students start to comprehend the fundamental organization of knowledge and can discriminate between truth and opinion. Kinanthi Tiasadi. (2020). English debate is a popular exercise for students since it allows them to improve their communication and English abilities while also developing their critical thinking.

While in aspect of evaluating is the ability to assess information using standards like quality, effectiveness, and consistency. Students are able to critiques the argument for the opponent, to evaluate information and solve problem by giving example, to defend their opinion, to compare and prove the argument. In aspect of creating is the ability to organize or produce prior information into a new product. This process of thinking is divided into the subcategories of generating, planning, and organizing. These substitutes interact with one another and guide the students' creative thinking (Anderson et al., 2001). The students are required to create the solutions to the issue and organize them into an action plan. The final step is the producing session, where the students create the answers to the assigned problems. Regarding this, (Sukla & Dungsungneon,

2016) Role of teaching strategies plays a vital role in such inculcation where students can analyze, interpret, reason out, synthesize, evaluate and create. In this aspect, Some of Students could develop their opinion but most of them are difficult to create a brilliant idea and think creatively. Studies (Yang & Rusli, 2012) investigated debate is a good tool to promote higher order and critical thinking skills.

There were ten questions given to Students to answer their standpoints about debate in promoting students' higher order thinking skill and Students' problem in debate practicing.

1. Do you think debate practice promote higher order thinking skill or critical thinking? Why?

Students' answer:

- Yes, debate can promote higher order thinking skill or critical thinking because need to have knowledge and improve it while debating.
- We must refute the arguments of the opponent.
- Debate is about critical thinking.
- Yes, debate can make me think critically about knowledge.

Debate needs students to use higher order thinking skills or critical thinking to develop a logical argumentation strategy. In other words, debate exercises teach students how to select the language and logic of thought while presenting an argument in particular circumstances.

2. How do you describe information relate to knowledge?

Students' answer:

- I will try to relate the knowledge to current event or relatable now days.
- I make examples based on the knowledge relate with daily life.
- Information relate the knowledge of person's opinion.
- I explain the meaning of information or knowledge and giving example.

Information is the specifics or facts about a topic. Information is what students can (or cannot) know, while knowledge is the knowing of something. The students can relate the knowledge by giving some examples with their daily life or their opinion.

3. Are you able to analyze information to understand knowledge?

Students' answer:

- Yes, I am capable to analyze the information.



- I am lack of vocabulary so I cannot present my argument because I cannot analyze the information.
- I am not sure about my knowledge so it is hard for me to analyze the information.
- I analyze the motion and knowledge before because if I do not analyze the knowledge, I do not understand it.

Researching a problem in order to fully understand it is the first stage in an efficient problem-solving process. Information analysis involves gathering and combining various pieces of data. Some of students are able to analyze the information but some of them cannot analyze it because of lack of vocabulary.

4. How do you defend your opinion?

Students' answer:

- By giving evidence and improve my opinion with the knowledge or real information.
- By giving real fact based on the knowledge.
- If I think, it is right to defend I will stand for it.
- I always give cases with example.

A natural application of defense is to back a claim students make while proactively identifying strategies to disarm any potential objections others may have to what we have proposed. Students are able to defend their opinion by giving real example or information and fact

5. How can you evaluate information or knowledge during debate?

Students' answer:

- By analyzing the credibility of the source of information.
- I can evaluate information if it is suitable with literature that I have
- Every information come out from my brain.
- I can evaluate the information and support my team

Teaching students to make sure that opinions are supported with the right explanations and evidence is one approach to assist them in evaluating. Students can study a commercial's arguments, identify each claim, and determine whether or not each claim is supported by arguments and evidence to introduce this skill.

6. Do you usually critique the arguments from your opponent?

Students' answer:

- Yes, if the opponent cannot prove their evidence, I will throw critique.
- Yes, I always critique to intimidate my opponent.
- It depends on what they said and in debating we have defend our argument so every person must be a critique one.
- I do not critique my opponent because I am not confident with my opinion.

Understanding how to analyze an argument enables students to identify logical errors, misleading data, and establish conclusions based on factual and logical evidence. Students can give or critique the argument from the opponent if they cannot prove their statement. Some of students cannot state their opinion because they do not have self-confidence to speak.

7. How do you create idea during debate?

Students' answer:

- By analyze, evaluate and improve the information.
- By collecting all information from my group, so I can improve and conclude the argument.
- I do not know exactly because my idea just come out from my brain
- If I dominate the motion, I can think critically and create idea about the motion.

Students that participate in debate are able to justify the value and credibility of each piece of evidence by relating it to the argument. They create idea in debating with analyze, collect information and understand the motion given.

8. Are you able to build argument relate the knowledge?

Students' answer:

- Yes, by giving evidence and example to strengthen the argument.
- By giving examples with real fact.
- Everyone can make an argument if they have knowledge about the topic.
- I am so difficult to build the argument because I do not dominate the motion when practicing debate in class.

Every speech is built on an argument. Learning to provide an ordered, appealing argument is essential for debate success. By giving evidence and fact example relate the topic, and understand the

motion. During debate, a good motion is one that is supported by both pro and con arguments; some of the students cannot build the argument because ones that favor the opposing side over the other.

9. How do you feel about your experience in debate practice?

Students' answer:

- My public speaking can be much better by debate practicing.
- I am exiting especially with the motion that is always debated.
  - It was my first experience. I do not like debate. It makes me crazy.
  - I feel so excited with my first time in debate practice by using English. It can make me think and promote my higher order thinking skill.

Debate practice can strengthen students' critical thinking abilities; create efficient presenting, organization, and research tools, Create strategies for overcoming speaking in public anxiety. In the first experience, students feel difficult to analyze, evaluate and create idea.

10. What is your problem faced in debating practice?

Students' answer:

- When I do not have knowledge in the topic, lack of vocabulary, and building idea.
- I am difficult in analyzing the knowledge, still less vocabulary so it is difficult to express what I want to say.
- My difficulties are knowledge and vocabulary because when we debate and we are less vocabulary, we cannot speak one's mind and creating aspect in higher order thinking skill is difficult for me especially if we lack information or knowledge.
- in the first time, I am so difficult to tell my opinion clearly.

The difficult parts of debating are developing one's own arguments in a clear and organized manner and enduring the other side's rebuttal. Lack of vocabulary, trouble defining the motion, difficulty setting limitations, difficulty becoming the first speaker in debate practice are among the challenges of the students.

There were six advantages of debate in promoting students' higher order thinking skill:

1. Argumentation

Debate teaches how to make arguments. Students have a great chance to apply argumentation theories in debate under circumstances that will help them understand and apply these ideas more effectively.

## 2. Understanding Today's Problems

Debate enables in-depth research and examination of significant current topics. Sincere educators have long been concerned that the general public and students still only have a limited understanding of crucial present issues.

## 3. Strengthening Critical Thinking Skills

Debate Develops Skill in Critical Thinking. Students participate in a learning environment that is specifically created to develop their critical thinking abilities via the study of argumentation and debate. Debaters learn to apply the principles of critical thinking to difficulties that arise not just in the more comfortable settings of study or briefing but also in the heat of discussion.

## 4. Promoting Improved Judgment

Debate encourages reasoning. Debaters start to comprehend the scale of the majority of modern concerns and realize the relevance of a multivalued viewpoint when they examine the good and bad scenarios that may occur. They learn that most current problems have more than one side when they discuss both sides of a question. They also learn that just one side of a statement may be represented by an extensive collection of principles.

## 5. Enhancing Speaking

The expectation is that the students will speak English fluently in debating. They could be inspired to speak by a contentious subject. Each person would have a unique perspective on a subject. Because of their limited vocabulary or poor pronunciation, it used to be difficult for them to communicate. But the more they use English to express themselves, the better they get at communicating in English.

## 6. Problem-solving Skills

Debate helps students develop their critical thinking and problem-solving abilities. Students successfully learn to present their views through this process, which include conducting content-related research and generating opinions on a subject that are supported by solid evidence and arguments. Due to the students' need to think quickly when speaking, debate activities might improve their critical thinking and communication skills. They must be able to provide arguments or concepts that are supported by facts and evidence.

From the explanation above, it showed that debate promoted students' higher order thinking skill, the students could analyze and evaluate the information or the other students' opinion, they could conclude an argument relate the topic. Besides, they learned to present an argument, argued and used English orally indirectly. The problem face by the students based on the result of observation and interview were less vocabulary that they have, and the aspect of higher order thinking skill, the students' difficulties in aspect of creating (C6), they could not create or build new idea and think critically relate the knowledge.

According to observation and interview the students, debate promote Students' higher order thinking skill because during active debate activities, students talk intensively express students' view. Students will be inspired to state his view because in active debate activities, the topics are debated is an interesting and controversial topic. They also practice to state the idea and think about the positive and negative side negative of a problem. Debates can provide benefits such as sharpening students to draw conclusions, conduct evaluations and create and argue arguments. (Mohammad et al., 2016) Debate is a type of teaching technique that also serves as a teaching approach. A bilateral relationship between teacher and student will develop under this learner-oriented approach, and each will have a separate role to play in the teaching and learning process. Through debate makes mastery of the material better, so debate can promote students' higher order thinking skill approach because it is not only thinking to remember but also increasing creativity and analysis to solve a problem. Students are not focused on memorizing material, but how the material is memorized and understood to be used in solving a problem creatively and critically. (Amiri, F., Jahedi, M., & Othman, 2017) These sorts of activities will foster creative and critical thinking and quick decision making in problem solving matters.

The students had some problem in debate practicing. First, some students have complained that they have trouble defining the motion, while others have pointed out that this is a common challenge in debate. It demonstrates that most students had trouble defining motion in debate practice and were sometimes unfamiliar with some terms of motion. Second, another student was less in speaking English or could not express their statements (argument) because he had a limited vocabulary. They found it difficult to express their idea or argument due to the fact that they still try to learn new words to employ in argumentative disputes despite having poor English skill. It can be concluded that vocabulary is a problem in speaking, especially in debating practice. The third, each speaker must defend the position against the refutation of the previous speaker. Each

speaker in a debate must refute the argument made by the person before them, and then the next speaker in line does the same. Contrary to this statement, it was found that most of the students found it difficult to rebut the opponent's argument. Some of them were difficult to refute the argument from the opponent. The fourth, in the practice of debate is the difficulty of expressing an argument. For some students, it can be difficult to express their opinion forcefully when they want to argue a point. Clarity is one skill in practicing debate. As a debater, it is important to be able to communicate complex issues in a clear and concise way. However, this can be a problem for students. The fifth, Debate helps students to become critical thinkers and make quick decisions in problem solving situations. However, the student felt that it was difficult to develop critical thinking and preparing material for debate when practicing. Some of the students were nervous when practicing debates because they have to think critically and they didn't prepare the material.

From the explanation above, the students should prepare and read more when they want to debate so the students can evaluate, analyze and create knowledge, creating idea relate the topic and think critically.

## E. CONCLUSION

Based on the results of research that has been carried out on students who have practiced debate in critical speaking subject, several conclusions can be obtained which are the answers to the following questions the formulation of the problems are as follows:

1. Practical debates that have been carried out on critical speaking subjects could promote higher thinking skill because in debating students were required to think critically according to aspects of Bloom's taxonomy, namely analyzing, evaluating and creating ideas based on the motions that have been given.
2. There were several problems faced by students during classroom English debate in critical speaking subject, namely trouble defining the motion, could not express their statements (argument) because they had a limited vocabulary, difficult to rebut the opponent's argument, the difficulty of expressing an argument and nervous when practicing debates because they have to think critically and they didn't prepare the material.

## REFERENCES

- Alsaleh, N. J. (2020). Teaching Critical Thinking Skills: Literature Review. *TOJET: The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology*, 19(1), 21–39.

- <http://www.tojet.net/articles/v19i1/1913.pdf>, diakses Minggu 25 April 2021%0Ahttps://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1239945
- Amiri, F., Jahedi, M., & Othman, M. (2017). A Case Study of The Development of an ESL Learner's Speaking Skills Through Instructional Debate. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 7(March), 2017. [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/315754489\\_A\\_Case\\_Study\\_of\\_the\\_Development\\_of\\_an\\_ESL\\_Learner%27s\\_Speaking\\_Skills\\_through\\_Instructional\\_Debate](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/315754489_A_Case_Study_of_the_Development_of_an_ESL_Learner%27s_Speaking_Skills_through_Instructional_Debate)
- Anderson, L. W., Krathwohl Peter W Airasian, D. R., Cruikshank, K. A., Mayer, R. E., Pintrich, P. R., Raths, J., & Wittrock, M. C. (2001). *Taxonomy for Assessing a Revision OF BLOOM'S TaxONOMy OF EducatiONal Objectives*. <https://www.uky.edu/~rsand1/china2018/texts/Anderson-Krathwohl - A taxonomy for learning teaching and assessing.pdf>
- Camp, J. M., & Schnader, A. L. (2010). Using debate to enhance critical thinking in the accounting classroom: The Sarbanes-Oxley act and U.S. tax policy. *Issues in Accounting Education*, 25(4), 655–675. <https://doi.org/10.2308/iace.2010.25.4.655>
- Churches, A. (2008). Bloom's Taxonomy blooms digitally. *Tech & Learning*, 196605124, 1–6. <http://www.techlearning.com/showArticle.php?articleID=196605124>
- Gay, LR. (2006). *Educational research competencies for analysis and applications*. (Pearson Education).
- Harefa, A. T., & Ndruru, R. J. (2022). Improving Students' Speaking ability Through Alley Debates Strategy. *Educativo: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 1(1), 207–215. <https://doi.org/10.56248/educativo.v1i1.29>
- Jagger, S. (2013). *Affective learning and the classroom debate*. *Innovations in Education & Teaching International*, 50(1), 38–50. <http://doi.org/10.1080/14703297.2012.746515>
- Mohammad, N., Zohre, M., Hassanali, B. N., & Kamal, N. H. (2016). Debate learning method and its implications for the formal education system. *Educational Research and Reviews*, 11(6), 211–218. <https://doi.org/10.5897/err2015.2316>
- Rohmah. (n.d.). *Disagreement Strategies in Rebuttal of Australian Parliamentary Debate at 5 Vocational High School Surabaya*.
- Rosyid, A., & Hidayati, I. N. (2019). Thinking Critically Through Debating: Promoting Students' Hots and Speaking Competence. *The 10th AISOFOLL*, 78–88. <https://repository.unpak.ac.id/tukangna/repo/file/files-20210209221234.pdf>
- Sukla, D., & Dungsungneon, A. P. (2016). Students Perceived Level and Teachers Teaching Strategies of Higher Order Thinking Skills; A Study on Higher Educational Institutions in Thailand. *Journal of Education and Practkice*, 7(12), 211–219.
- Tiasadi, K. (2020). Debating practice to support critical thinking skills: Debaters' perception. *AKSARA: Jurnal Babasa Dan Sastra*, 21(1), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.23960/aksara/v21i1.pp1-16>
- W. Conklin & W. Bruce. 2012. *Higher order thinking skill to develop 21st century Students*. Shell Education

Publishing, Inc. Huntington.  
[https://books.google.co.id/books?hl=id&lr=&id=rFLYAAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PA7&dq=W.+Conklin+%26+J.+Manfro.+2012.+Higher+order+thinking+skill+to+develop+21st++century+Students.+Shell+Education+Publishing,+Inc.+Huntington.&ots=M9mSQ98Gq8&sig=88JOOlrSBP89ESjaKB7WoUO\\_gho&redir\\_esc=y#v=onepage&q&f=false](https://books.google.co.id/books?hl=id&lr=&id=rFLYAAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PA7&dq=W.+Conklin+%26+J.+Manfro.+2012.+Higher+order+thinking+skill+to+develop+21st++century+Students.+Shell+Education+Publishing,+Inc.+Huntington.&ots=M9mSQ98Gq8&sig=88JOOlrSBP89ESjaKB7WoUO_gho&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q&f=false)

Weiss, E. (2003). *Problem-Based Learning in the Information Age: Designing Problems to Promote Higher-order Thinking*. Wiley Periodicals, Vol. 95

Wenno, I. H., Jamaludin, J., & Batlolona\*, J. R. (2021). The Effect of Problem Based Learning Model on Creative and Critical Thinking Skills in Static Fluid Topics. *Jurnal Pendidikan Sains Indonesia*, 9(3), 498–511. <https://doi.org/10.24815/jpsi.v9i3.20829>

Yang, C.-H., & Rusli, E. (2012). Using Debate As A Pedagogical Tool In Enhancing Pre-Service Teachers Learning And Critical Thinking. *Journal of International Education Research (JIER)*, 8(2), 135–144. <https://doi.org/10.19030/jier.v8i2.6833>