#### THE CHARACTERISTICS OF EFFECTIVE EFL TEACHERS AS PERCEIVED BY STUDENTS: A STUDY AT UIN ALAUDDIN MAKASSAR

#### Muhammad Nur Akbar Rasyid

(Dosen Bahasa dan Sastra Inggris Fakultas Adab dan Humaniora UIN Alauddin)

#### Abstrak

Dosen harus memiliki karakteristik yang diperlukan dalam menciptakan proses pembelajaran yang efektif. Karena itu, menurut hasil penelitian, dosen bahasa Inggris yang baik antara lain memiliki kemampuan bahasa Inggris yang bagus, kreatif dalam menyampaikan materi pembelajaran, bersikap ramah, dan objektif dalam memberikan penilaian terhadap tugas dan kemapuan mahasiswa. Beberapa ciri yang diungkapkan responden spesifik untuk pengajar bahasa Inggris, dan juga ada beberapa karakter yang berlaku universal untuk pengajar secara umum.

Key Words: Students' perceptions, effective EFL teachers, English proficiency, and personal attributes

#### A. Background of the Study

There is no doubt that teachers play fundamental roles in the teaching and learning activities. Teachers are at the 'front lines' in the implementation of the curriculum that have been designed. They are the ones who are the most directly and frequently in contact, with students during the teaching and learning activities. They are the figures who are expected to evaluate the quality of their student learning. Those universal roles apply to teachers of all subject matters, including tertiary teachers of English as a Foreign Language (EFL). Therefore, any effort for the enhancement of student learning experience and student learning outcomes at any level of education must consider the strategic roles of the teachers as the 'front liners'. J Chen<sup>1</sup> argue that the attributes teachers demonstrate during the teaching and learning activities can either discourage or encourage the effectiveness of student learning.

One of the attempts to maximize the roles of teachers in their teaching roles is by researching what characterizes effective teachers. The evidence based information gathered from such studies will be useful for teachers to put into their daily teaching practices. Empirical studies examining perceptions of what constitutes effective tertiary EFL teachers indeed have been extensive within the existing literature. This is particularly the case with studies carried out in the context of western countries in comparison to characteristics of effective EFL teachers as perceived in non-western contexts. Zhang and Watkins<sup>2</sup> acknowledged that while there is a plethora of studies examining what characterizes effective teachers in western countries, conception of good teachers have been much less explored in the non-western context.

Further investigation within the existing literature that explored the conceptions of effective EFL teachers in the non-western contexts indicates that there are very few studies that have been undertaken in the context of Indonesian higher education. Most of the existing empirical studies were undertaken in other countries, for example, China<sup>3</sup>, Iran<sup>45</sup>, Saudi and Yemen<sup>6</sup>, Thailand<sup>7</sup>, and Korea<sup>8910</sup>.

One of the few studies conducted in the Indonesian higher education context was undertaken by Liando<sup>11</sup>. Her study, which was quantitative in nature, was partly aimed at investigating the perspectives of students and teachers in university context about best EFL teacher characteristics. This study involved 126 students and 28 teachers in one university. Her findings revealed that among the top four characteristics described by the students were friendliness, mastery of subject matter knowledge, kindness, and the employment of interesting teaching delivery such as the use of jokes. The most striking finding was that friendliness component was chosen by 100 percent of the total students participated in the study.

While this previous study provides information about the participants' preferences of 14 EFL teachers' characteristics included in the surveys, the present study examined closely students' perceptions of the attributes of effective EFL teachers using qualitative approach. This means that the present study provides wider opportunities for participants to describe their perspectives of what characterizes effective university EFL teachers.

## B. Objectives and Significance of the Study

Based on the background above, the major purpose of the present study is to explore the key features of effective tertiary EFL teachers as perceived by participants in one Islamic higher education in Indonesia, namely UIN Alauddin Makassar. As noted in the previous section that investigation within the existing literature suggests that there are very few such empirical studies in Indonesian higher education context, in particular in Islamic higher education institutions. This study is essential to serve as a reference for teachers in their teaching and learning practice in the EFL classrooms. This study can also be one of the bases for decision makers to set policy and system related to the teaching and learning of EFL in higher education institutions.

## C. Brief Review of Literature

This section provides a brief review of related literature regarding the characteristics of effective EFL teachers. Some key features of the qualities of effective EFL teachers can be gleaned from the results of the previous studies.

Chen<sup>12</sup> in his study conducted in Thailand revealed two major categories of effective EFL teachers' attributes, namely personal trait-related characteristics and classroom teaching-related characteristics. The first category involved such attributes as emotion, kindness, fairness, lenience, and responsibility while the latter included things like teaching delivery, English use in teaching, classroom activity organization, and classroom atmosphere creation.

Several key features of effective EFL teachers were also identified in the study conducted by Y. Chen and Lin<sup>13</sup> which examined students' perceptions of effective EFL teachers in China. Those identified features were pedagogical competence, personality, and student-teacher relationship components. It was further indicated that students perceived teachers' personality and their relationships with students as more important attributes than instructional competence of the teachers.

The similar features of effective EFL teachers was also revealed in the study undertaken by Barnes and Lock<sup>14</sup>, who examined students' conceptions of the features of effective EFL teachers. This study involved 105 university students in Korean university. Those participants were asked to write their descriptions of effective EFL teachers. The results indicated five categories of students' responses. This included rapport, delivery, fairness, knowledge and credibility, and organization and preparation. The participants' responses also indicated rapport and delivery attributes as two most frequently discussed features of effective EFL teachers. The first category covered things like friendliness, caring, patient, accommodative, charismatic, and have a sense humor. The latter category included such things like being enthusiastic in teaching, giving clear explanation, using a wide range of teaching methods, and encouraging student participation. It was further assumed that students perceived establishing rapport as the most important category given this was the most often mentioned category in the participants' descriptions.

## **D.** Research Methods

#### 1. Participants

The participants in this study were 15 EFL undergraduate students in State Islamic University (UIN) Alauddin Makassar. They were majoring in English either in English Education or in English Literature in the university. The selection of the participants considered the representation and a balance between males and females. Students were selected in this study since they are the most directly in contact with teachers and the most influenced by the quality of the EFL teachers. A number of researchers indicate the importance of involving students as participants in this kind of studies, for example Shishavan and Sadeghi<sup>15</sup> and Park and Lee<sup>16</sup>. Barnes and Lock<sup>17</sup> argue that examining students' perceptions of effective EFL teachers is fundamental as this provides teachers with necessary information of how to approach and improve their teaching practice.

## 2. Data collection

The writer gathered the data by employing two methods of data collection. They were individual semi structured interviews and focus group discussion. Five participants were involved in the individual semi-structured interviews, and ten participants were included in the two focus group discussions with five participants in each group. The major question addressed to the participants was about their descriptions of effective EFL teachers.

## 3. Data Analysis

The writer analyzed the data by using thematic coding. Firstly, the writer read and reread each participant's responses to get a general sense of participants' descriptions of key features of the quality EFL teachers. Then, the writer examined each transcript in greater details to identify features of quality EFL teachers emerged in the participants' report. Sample of identified features were then taken and discussed with one independent university teacher to get feedback and make some necessary revision. The next process was listing the key features described by participants which were followed by categorizing these key features into four major categories on the basis the commonalities and differences.

## E. Presentation of the Findings

This section presents the findings of the present study on the basis of the analysis on learners' responses in individual interviews and focus group discussions. The results of the analysis revealed that learners' descriptions of what constituted effective tertiary EFL teachers demonstrated several core attributes. Those attributes are classified into four major categories: Knowledge of English, Teaching Delivery, Assessment of Student Learning, and Personal Attributes. Each of these domains includes several interrelated characteristics.

## 1. Knowledge of English

The theme of being proficient in English was among the most frequent attribute of effective EFL teachers identified in the participants' discussion. The participants indicated the necessity of EFL teachers to be competent in the subject matter they were teaching. An EFL teacher is required to be competent in English. What I mean is that he or she is knowledgeable and skilful in the targeted language. This is important to make sure they present the materials that they are assigned to. (Participant 4)

Effective EFL teachers are those who are competent in English and are able to present EFL teaching materials to the students. So, what is important is their ability in English. (Participant 1)

It was described that when teachers had sound content knowledge of their discipline, they would be able to provide their students with detail explanation and make students feel enlightened and satisfied during the teaching and learning activities. Teachers would also feel confident in delivering their teaching to the students.

Effective EFL teachers are mastery of English. This is important. So they feel confident to present their materials before students. If they are not competent, students are able to identify it. This will later influence the student enthusiasm to join the class. (Participant 4)

It is important that teachers are proficient in English because we [students] need input from the teachers. If they are not competent, we will get nothing additional information or skills from them. (FG two)

# 2. Teaching Deliverya. Effective use of teaching methods

The theme of creative use of teaching methods was among the most frequently emerged attributes of effective EFL teachers in the participants' protocols. The participants described that effective teachers were competent of using diverse teaching methods. This feature was argued essential in order to make students feel interested in joining the teaching and learning process. This later was expected to contribute to student learning outcomes.

The next one [attributes of effective EFL teachers] is creative use of teaching methods. Sometime I have EFL teachers who employ the same methods of teaching from the beginning until the end of the semester. This results in the students' feeling of bored, including me. So, teachers must be creative in delivering their teaching. (Participant 5)

Yeah, I think their teaching methods. Effective EFL teachers have diverse teaching methods in teaching and learning process. (Participant 4)

Effective use of teaching delivery was considered essential. The participants indicated in their descriptions that it was quite often that they had

teachers who were knowledgeable and had good proficiency in English. However, they did not know how to deliver their teaching effectively.

We sometime have teachers who are excellent in terms of their English proficiency. But they have issues with transferring their teaching content to their students. In this case, they are not creative in delivering their teaching. On the other hand, we sometime have teachers who are just mediocre smart in their English proficiency, but they are capable of teaching their subject matter to students effectively with the use diverse teaching methods. (Participant 3)

#### b. Creative use of teaching media

The participants also raised the notion of effective use of teaching media as another attribute of effective EFL teachers. Some of the teaching media indicated by the participants were things like the use of the power point presentation, LCD projectors, sound systems, and the internet.

Effective EFL teachers are able to make the maximum use of teaching media, such as the use of sound systems, LCD projectors, and the internet. (Participant 2)

I think effective EFL teachers are those who are skilful in the use of teaching media such as the power point presentation, and LCD projectors. (Participant 3)

## c. Enjoyable classroom atmosphere

Another attribute of effective EFL teachers emerged in the students' discussion related to the domain of teaching delivery was about creating pleasant classroom atmosphere. The students described that it was important that teachers were able to create classroom atmosphere which was interesting, relaxing, and comfortable. Such classroom atmosphere would likely contribute to the feelings of relax and less stressful for students during the teaching and learning activities.

In my opinion, effective EFL teachers should be able to create pleasant learning environment for their students. It is an atmosphere where students do not feel stressful or under pressure. I think when students feel unpleasant; it will be hard for them to understand the content of the teaching. (Participant 2)

Yeah, ... I think another characteristic of effective EFL teachers can be seen in their ability to manage the classroom. So, they can make their classroom atmosphere entertaining and relaxing for students. (FG two)

#### d. Encourage student participation and practice

The participants also described effective EFL teachers in terms of the promotion of student participation, including encouraging students to use English during the teaching and learning processes. It was argued that this was important to make students active in the class and use the targeted language they were learning.

Teachers provide students with opportunities to practice their English. This can be undertaken through encouragement to use English when they ask questions or discussing with peers. (FG one)

*Effective EFL teachers encourage students to be active during the teaching and learning process.* (*Participant* 1)

#### e. Well-organized and well-structured materials

The theme of presenting learning materials in a well-structured arrangement was also raised by students in their discussion of effective EFL teachers. The participants expected that teachers presented their learning materials to the students systematically, step by step, based on the level of difficulties. This is to make the content of teaching easier for students to understand.

In my point of view, effective EFL teachers present their materials a well-structured fashion. Say for example they first explain the general concept of the EFL materials and then provide detail and practical examples. After that, they provides students with discussion sessions for more interactive discussion between, and among students and teachers. (Participant 5)

Effective EFL teachers are able to arrange the content of their teaching based on the level of difficulties. Thus, this will help students to understand the subject matter. (FG one)

#### 3. Assessment of student learning

The theme of fairness and objective grading systems was also frequently emerged in the participants' discussion. The participants described that effective teachers were featured with objective grading systems. In this case, the grades or marks that teachers assigned to students were based on the efforts students had put into their work and performance. It was not influenced by other aspects.

I think one of the features of Effective EFL teachers are objective in grading their students work and performance. (Participant 4)

I often have teachers who are not objective in their grading system. I often find a case that my friends who are lazy to come to class got higher marks than those who are diligent. I do not know why. But, I

think what is important for teachers are to be objective in assigning grades. (FG one)

#### 4. Personal attributes

## a. Friendliness

Being friendly was among the most frequently identified attribute of effective EFL teachers in the participants' discussion. It was described that it was important that teachers demonstrated good relationship with their students and not being arrogant to them. This attribute could be seen in the following samples of students' responses:

... the second characteristics of effective EFL teachers is friendly. In this case, they are friendly with their students which results in students' feeling of respect to their respective teachers. (Participant 5)

Ideally, teachers must not be arrogant to their students. Instead, they treat students with respect (FGD one)

Participants described that when teachers were friendly in their interactions with their students, EFL learners would most likely enjoy the teaching and learning activities. This was because friendly teachers were able to create a non-threatening classroom atmosphere which was essential for effective student learning. This concept is interrelated with the previous concept of creating enjoyable classroom atmospheres. The evidence of this can be seen in the following transcript:

Yeah ... I have ever had teachers who seem to be unfriendly and arrogant. For those teachers who are like this, we [students] feel under pressure during the teaching and learning activities because of their personalities. (Participant 5)

Therefore, it was expected that teachers could be responsive to their students' conditions and tried to accommodate it in their teaching practices. One participant indicated that it was important that teachers were able to act just like friends for their students. It was expected that teachers served as the figures for students to share their academic problems. This could happen as argued when teachers tried to minimize the big gaps in student-teacher relationships.

In my opinion, ... effective teachers can be seen in their social relationships with their students. In this case, effective teachers are those who can be just like friends for their students. So, students can share their academic issues with their teachers. There are no big gaps between students and teachers in their relationships. (Participant 3)

#### b. Disciplines with the time and schedules

Participants also described effective EFL teachers in terms of their management of time. This theme was frequently found in the participants' responses. It was described, for example, that it was necessary that teachers were on time with their teaching schedules. Thus, the issue of time management was important attribute to be perceived as effective teachers in the participants' view points.

*OK*, well... in my opinion the first attribute of effective EFL teachers are those who are on time. They are not late to come to the class. (FG one)

One thing for sure is that teachers must be discipline. In my point of view, discipline does not refer to being on time to come to the class but being able to follow the schedules arranged by the department or faculty in terms of examination schedules for mid and final examinations. (Participant 1)

#### c. Caring and understanding the students' conditions

Participants also identified features of effective EFL teachers in terms of accommodating and understanding student conditions. They strived to examine the students' issues when students had problems. For example, it was described that when student came late, good teachers did not automatically blamed students without first asking them the reasons for their lateness. Another example described by the participants was that when students seemed to be inattentive, they tried to approach the students to find the problems, and discuss the possible solutions.

In my opinion, effective EFL teachers are those who are able to understand the conditions of their students. For example, when students come late to the class, they do not directly punish the students. They instead try to find out the reasons behind it. They try to find out what are the difficulties encountered by their students. (FG one)

Good teachers are sensitive to their students' conditions. For example, when they notice one of their students seems to be inattentive, they try to find what makes that student becomes inattentive and find the solution for it. (FG Two)

#### d. Having a sense of humor

The theme of teachers to have a sense of humor during the teaching and learning activities was also raised by the participants in their discussion of effective EFL teachers. It was described that effective teachers should not be too serious during the teaching and learning process as this might contribute to the students' feeling of under pressure. It was desirable that teachers sometimes demonstrated their sense of humor during the class by saying some jokes when necessary.

In my opinion, good teachers should not be too serious because when they are too serious during the teaching and learning process, it will influence the students' mood in learning. They will feel stressful or the like. So, in my point of view, teachers should create relax learning atmosphere. If it is possible teachers should include jokes in their teaching. (FG one)

## e. Respecting students' opinions

Another feature of effective EFL teachers emerged in the participants' discussion related to the domain of personal attributes was respectful of students' opinion. It was expected that teachers were approachable and open for any input that came from their students' perspectives. They took their students' opinion into consideration. Therefore, they were communicative and available for sharing and discussion with their students.

In my opinion, effective EFL teachers are flexible to their students in the sense that they are willing to listen to input from their students. So, ... effective teachers are not arrogant but they respect their students' input. (FG two)

Good teachers are those who are approachable and communicative to their students. (Participant 1)

# f. Are committed to, and responsible for their student learning

Effective EFL teachers were also described in terms of being committed to, and responsible for their teaching roles. Effective teachers were those who took responsibility and tried to help their student learning. They listened and accommodated the students' issues to help their student learning.

Effective EFL teachers are responsible for the student learning. They listen and take care of the students' issues in their learning. (FG two)

Many teachers seem to have lack of responsibilities in their teaching roles. They do not realise that they have a big responsibility for helping student learning. (FG One)

## 5. Discussion and Implications

Having presented the results of the analysis in the previous section, this section discusses the core findings of the present study. As described in the previous section, students' descriptions of effective tertiary EFL teachers can be classified into four major categories which includes English language proficiency, EFL teaching delivery, assessment of student learning and personal attributes.

132

With regard to English proficiency, it is clearly evident in the participants' discussion that they believed that effective EFL teachers were featured with excellent English proficiency. The students seemed to feel strong about this attribute as this was among the most frequently identified concept in their discussion. It was described that competent teachers are able to explain their learning materials to the students. This finding adds evidence to the extensive body of theoretical and empirical studies highlighting the necessity of teachers to have sound content knowledge in their discipline. Ghasemi and Hashemi<sup>18</sup>, for example, indicated in their study that being knowledgeable was one of the attributes of effective EFL teachers. This finding is also similar to the study by Mahmoud and Thabet<sup>19</sup>, which also identified in their study conducted in Saudi and Yemen that good English teachers were those who were competent and qualified in English.

In a study conducted by Trice and Harris<sup>20</sup> in America and Bulgaria on examining qualities of teachers, it was identified that Bulgarian students indicated mastery of the content knowledge was the most important characteristics of quality teachers. The finding of the present study implies the needs for EFL teachers to ensure they have necessary competencies for the English teaching roles. It also important that the university provides EFL teachers with academic development programs to improve their competencies in English.

With respect to the category of teaching delivery, several core features of effective EFL teacher were also worth noting. The creative use of diverse teaching methods and teaching media was described essential for effective EFL teachers. The use of diverse teaching methods was expected to accommodate diverse needs of the EFL learners. In addition, the participants also highlighted that effective EFL teachers were able to create learning atmosphere that was comfortable and interesting for students. Such atmosphere was considered fundamental for students in order to make them feel relax during the teaching and learning activities. The participants also perceived the notion of wellorganized and well-structured materials as other features of effective EFL teachers.

Those findings parallel with prior empirical studies. For example, Liando<sup>21</sup> in her study conducted in one university Indonesia also found that the abilities to create interesting classroom atmosphere and to explain the teaching materials well were among the most important features of quality EFL teachers. These findings have many implications for the EFL teaching practices. Teachers of English are expected to be able to employ various teaching methods in delivering the learning materials. They are required to be able create interesting learning environment where students feel relax and comfortable in joining the EFL classrooms. The possible challenge then

becomes whether or not resources and infrastructure are available to support EFL teachers to create such classroom atmospheres expected by the students.

With regard to the category of assessment of student learning, participant highlighted one key issue of effective EFL teachers, which was about being fair and objective in assigning students' marks. It was described that effective EFL teachers were objective when assessing their students' works. In this case, the grades they obtained were suitable with the quality of their effort and learning. This finding is in line with several previous studies. Liando<sup>22</sup>, for example, revealed in her study that many of the students also indicated 'fairness' as one attribute of effective tertiary EFL teachers. Barnes and Lock<sup>23</sup> also revealed in their study conducted in Korea that fairness in treating students and grading students' works were among the features of effective EFL teachers perceived by their respondents. This finding implies the needs for teachers to be fair and objective in treating their students, in particular when they assign their students' marks.

With regard to the personal attribute category, several core attributes emerged in the participants' discussion of effective EFL teachers. This includes things like being friendly, being discipline, having a sense of humor, and respecting students' input. The participants frequently indicated that effective EFL teachers demonstrated good relationships with their students, including being friendly and could act just like friends for their students. Hence, students did not feel under pressure when interacting with their teachers. It was described that they also respected the students' opinion and treated them with respects. These findings confirm the findings of the study undertaken by Liando<sup>24</sup> in one university in Manado, Indonesia, which revealed that all student participants indicated that 'friendliness' as attribute of effective EFL teachers. The finding of the present study on the concept of friendliness is also in line with other studies undertaken in other countries. For example, J. Chen<sup>25</sup>, who conducted a study in Thailand, identified that most students in his study believed that effective EFL teacher ought to be kind, polite, and friendly. The similar attribute was also indicated in the study conducted by Mahmoud and Thabet in Saudi and Yemen<sup>26</sup>.

It is also important to note that another feature of effective EFL teachers emerged in the participants; discussion was being discipline. This concept referred to being on time not only to come to the class for teaching and learning process but also to follow the examination schedules arranged by departments or faculties. This concept is one of the unique findings in the present study, highlighting the necessity for teachers to have a good time management. The implication of this finding is that it is important for teachers to ensure they are able to manage their time well and being discipline to come to the class to deliver their teaching. It is also worth noting that the participants also identified the concept of having a sense of humor as another feature of effective EFL teachers. Teachers were expected to include some jokes during the teaching and learning process where appropriate. It was described that the possession of this feature was important to help teachers create relaxing classroom atmosphere where students felt comfortable during the teaching and learning activities. This line of thought is in concert with the findings revealed in Liando's study<sup>27</sup>, which revealed that 'humorous' was also indicated by students as one of the most important features of effective EFL teachers. This concept was also identified in the findings of the study conducted by J. Chen<sup>28</sup>.

#### F. Conclusion and Recommendation

This section highlights the major conclusion of the present study. This is then followed by a section of recommendations, which indicate the points of departure from the present study.

#### 1. Conclusion

The present study has investigated the characteristics of effective tertiary EFL teachers as perceived by university students in one Islamic higher education in Indonesia. The emerging attributes were grouped into four major categories, namely knowledge of English, EFL teaching delivery, assessment of student learning, and personal attributes. It was perceived that effective EFL teachers were proficient in English and objective in their grading system. With regard to personal attributes, several key features of effective EFL teachers included being friendly, respectful, discipline, and having a sense of humor. Being creative in the use of teaching methods, and media; being well-organized and presenting the learning materials in well-structured fashion; and creating comfortable classroom atmosphere were the core features of effective EFL teachers that are related to the domain of teaching delivery.

Examining those core features of effective EFL teachers, it is clear that some of them related specifically to the teaching of English, while some other attributes are universal in the sense they are basically related to teaching of other subject matters. Thus, it is important that EFL teachers and teachers in general consider these identified features of effective EFL teachers in their teaching practices. This is to ensure that their teaching practices and attitudes are relevant to the expectation of the students.

Several limitations are inherent to the present study. The data for the present study only involved small number of students from one Islamic higher education context in Indonesia. Thus, the findings of the present study cannot be generalized to other contexts or universities in Indonesia. Careful consideration needs to be taken into account when the results of the present study are going to be applied to other university contexts.

## 2. Recommendation for policy and practice

- a. The present study has revealed some key features of quality EFL teachers which are categorised under four major categories. Therefore, it is suggested that institution leaders or decision makers take these into account in setting policy and practice related to the teaching and learning of EFL.
- b. Given the present study has indicated several key features of the quality of EFL teachers as perceived by students, it is very important that EFL teachers consider these features and take into account in their daily EFL teaching practices.
- c. The present study has indicated several personal traits as perceived by learners, which include things like being friendly, respectful, and having a good sense of humor. Therefore, it is suggested that EFL teachers maintain and increase good rapport with their students by demonstrating these socio-affective personalities.

#### 3. Recommendation for further research

- a. While the present study only involved a small number of students, further research might include bigger number respondents in order to more comprehensively and deeply explore learners' perceptions of what characterizes effective tertiary EFL teachers.
- b. While this study is not able to suggest the ranks of each core qualities of effective EFL teachers as its qualitative in nature, further studies might examine which of these features are perceived important on the basis of rank order.
- c. Given this present study focused on gathering English learners' perceptions of the quality of EFL teachers, further study might involve other stakeholders' perceptions, in particular the EFL teachers. This is to allow the comparison of the two parties which are the most directly involved in the EFL teaching and learning activities.

<sup>3</sup> See *Ibid*.

Endnote

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Jun Chen, Favorable and unfavorable characteristics of EFL teachers perceived by university students of Thailand (International Journal of English Linguistics, 2(1), pp.213-219, 2012), p.213.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Qunying Zhang and David Watkins, *Conceptions of a good tertiary EFL teacher in China* (TESOL Quarterly, 41(4), pp.781-790, 2007), p.782.

<sup>4</sup> See Babak Ghasemi and Masoud Hashemi, *The study of the characteristics of successful english language teachers from the view point of the English language students of Islamic Azad University, Hamedan Branch* (Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences, 28, pp. 411-415, 2011).

<sup>5</sup> See also for another study conducted in Iran by Homa Babai Shishavan, and Karim Sadeghi, *Characteristics of an effective English language teacher as perceived by Iranian teachers and learners of English* (English Language Teaching, 2(4), pp.130-143, 2009).

<sup>6</sup> Al-Matqtri Mahmoud, and Ahmad Thabet, *The qualities of the good English teacher as perceived by Saudi and Yemeni college students of English* (Greener Journal of Educational Research, 3(2), pp,72-79, 2013).

<sup>7</sup> See Jun Chen , *op. cit.* p.213.

<sup>8</sup> Bruce D. Barnes, and Graeme Lock, *The attributes of effective lecturers of English as a foreign language as perceived by students in a Korean university* (Australian Journal of Teacher Education, 35(1), pp.139-152, 2010).

<sup>9</sup> See also Gi-Pyo Park, and Hyo-Woong Lee, *The characteristics of effective English teachers* as perceived by high school teachers and students in Korea (Asia Pacific Education Review, 7(2), pp.236-248, 206, 2006).

<sup>10</sup> Bruce D. Barnes, and Graeme Lock, *Student perceptions of effective foreign language teachers: A quantitative investigation from a Korean university* (Australian Journal of Teacher Education, 38(2),pp.19-36, 2013).

<sup>11</sup> Nihta V. F. Liando, *Students' vs teachers' perspectives on best teacher characteristics in EFL classroom* (TEFLIN Journal: A publication on the teaching and learning of English, 21(2),pp.118-136, 2010).

<sup>12</sup> See Jun Chen, *op. cit.* p.213.

<sup>13</sup> See Y. Chen, and S. Lin, *Exploring Characteristics for effective EFL teachers: From the perceptions of junior high school students in Tainan* (STUT Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences, 2, pp.219-249, 2009).

<sup>14</sup> See Bruce D. Barnes, and Graeme Lock, 2010, *op. cit.* p.142.

<sup>15</sup> See Homa Babai Shishavan, and Karim Sadeghi, op. cit. p.132.

<sup>16</sup> See Gi-Pyo Park, and Hyo-Woong Lee, op. cit. p.236.

<sup>17</sup> Bruce D. Barnes, and Graeme Lock, 2013, op. cit. p.19.

<sup>18</sup> See Babak Ghasemi and Masoud Hashemi, op. cit. p.414.

<sup>19</sup> See also the findings in the study undertaken by Al-Matqtri Mahmoud, and Ahmad Thabet, *op,cit.*p.76.

<sup>20</sup> Ashton D. Trice, and Charles M. Harris, *Perceptions of teacher qualities By American And Bulgarian preservice teachers* (Education, 122(2), pp.381-385, 2001), p.384.

<sup>21</sup> See Nihta V. F. Liando, op. cit. p.122.

<sup>22</sup> See *Ibid*.p.123.

<sup>23</sup> See Bruce D. Barnes, and Graeme Lock, 2010, *op. cit.* p.147.

<sup>24</sup> See Nihta V. F. Liando, op. cit. p.122.

<sup>25</sup> Jun Chen, *op. cit.* p.216.

<sup>26</sup> See also the findings in the study undertaken by Al-Matqtri Mahmoud, and Ahmad Thabet, *op,cit.*p.76.

<sup>27</sup> See Nihta V. F. Liando, op. cit. p.123.

<sup>28</sup> Jun Chen . *op. cit.* p.215.

137

#### REFERENCES

- Barnes, B. D., & Lock, G. (2010). The attributes of effective lecturers of English as a foreign language as perceived by students in a Korean university. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, 35(1), 139-152.
- Barnes, B. D., & Lock, G. (2013). Student perceptions of effective foreign language teachers: A quantitative investigation from a Korean university. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, 38(2), 19-36.
- Chen, J. (2012). Favorable and unfavorable characteristics of EFL teachers perceived by university students of Thailand. *International Journal of English Linguistics*, 2(1), 213-219.
- Chen, Y., & Lin, S. (2009). Exploring characteristics for effective EFL teachers: From the perceptions of junior high school students in Tainan. *STUT Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 2, 219-249.
- Ghasemi, B., & Hashemi, M. (2011). The study of the characteristics of successful english language teachers from the view point of the English language students of Islamic Azad University, Hamedan Branch. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 28, 411-415.
- Liando, N. V. (2010). Students' vs teachers' perspectives on best teacher characteristics in EFL classroom. *TEFLIN Journal: A publication on the teaching and learning of English, 21*(2), 118-136.
- Mahmoud, A.-M., & Thabet, A. (2013). the qualities of the good english teacher as perceived by Saudi and Yemeni college students of English. (*Greener Journal of Educational Research*, 3(2), 72-79.
- Park, G.-P., & Lee, H.-W. (2006). The characteristics of effective English teachers as perceived by high school teachers and students in Korea. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 7(2), 236-248.
- Shishavan, H. B., & Sadeghi, K. (2009). Characteristics of an effective english language teacher as perceived by Iranian teachers and learners of English. *English Language Teaching*, 2(4), 130-143.
- Trice, A. D., & Harris, C. M. (2001). Perceptions of teacher qualities By American And Bulgarian preservice teachers. *Education*, 122(2), 381-385.
- Zhang, Q., & Watkins, D. (2007). Conceptions of a good tertiary EFL teacher in China. *TESOL Quarterly*, 41(4), 781-790.