# AL RISALAH: Jurnal Ilmu Syariah dan Hukum

VOLUME 22 NO 2, NOVEMBER 2022 P-ISSN: 2252-8334 / E-ISSN: 2550-0309

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License https://doi.org/10.24252/al-risalah.vi.28592

# Participatory Principles in Forming the Regional Parking Regulations in Makassar City

Nur Azizah<sup>1</sup>, Marwati Riza<sup>2</sup>, Muh. Hasrul<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1,2,3</sup>Faculty of Law, Hasanuddin University, Makassar. E-mail: akhmadnurazizah90@gmail.com

#### Abstract

Considering the importance of community participation in the process of forming local regulations, which are sometimes overlooked by the local government and the Regional House of Representatives, this study was conducted to analyze the forms and implications of community participation in forming the regional parking regulations in Makassar City using an empirical research type. The approaches in this study were the statutory approach, the stratification approach, and the sociological approach. The data analysis used a qualitative method in the form of descriptive analysis. The results of the study showed: 1) the forms of community participation in forming the regional regulations in Makassar City could be divided into three stages. First, community participation in the ante-legislative stage included 1) Research; 2) Discussions, Workshops, and Seminars; 3) Initiative proposals; and 4) Draft Bill. Second, public participation in the legislative stage included 1) Audience; 2) Alternative Draft Bills; 3) input through print media; 4) input via electronic media; 5) demonstrations; and 6) discussions, workshops, and seminars. Third, people's participation in the post-legislative stage included 1) demonstrations, 2) law review, and 3) socialization of the law. The implications for forming regional regulations that do not use participatory principles can be seen from two sides, namely public legal awareness and community legal compliance. The community and parking attendants are aware but disobedient due to several factors, namely accessibility, legal knowledge, understanding of the law, patterns of legal behavior, and factors of the long-standing legal culture of the community. As a result, the effectiveness of forming regional regulations has not been effective because they still need to fulfill the principles of forming laws, namely the principles of efficiency and effectiveness, as well as the principle of openness.

Keywords: Participatory Principles; formation of regional regulations; parking

#### INTRODUCTION

Makassar is one of the metropolitan areas in Indonesia with a population density of 1,504,158 residents. The buffer areas include Maros, Gowa, and Takalar

(Mamminasata). Most of the community's daily activities are centered in Makassar City as a destination for people to work and earn income. It does not rule out the possibility that people use vehicles in their activities, so they need land to park them. By seeing these conditions, the local government used parking as land to increase local revenue and formed regulations regarding parking fees, namely the first parking regulation Number 1 of 1999 Series B Number 1 concerning parking fees on public roads. In practice, parking fees at that time were fully regulated by the regional head (mayor), and the object of the fee depended on the level of crowds in the place. Then in 2006, Regional Government Regulation Number 17 of 2006 concerning the management of public roadside parking in the Makassar City area was established by the regional government and Regional House of Representatives in order to realize a more efficient and successful implementation of public roadside parking and to improve services to the community. In practice, the local government will form a regional company to manage the park.

Laws and regulations are not made in neutral conditions or situations but are in the dynamics of the life of the wider community with all its complexities. It means that the community addressed by legislation faces various limitations in accepting the presence of statutory regulation. A statutory regulation made unilaterally by the legislator. Its presence will likely be rejected because it is not in accordance with the sense of justice in society. This is where the importance of community participation is in the process of forming the legislation. The formation of regional regulations regulates the way of life of the community in the area because it concerns social life; the community has the right to participate in decision-making by the local government.

The establishment of a parking regulation was originally formed to be a solution for the community related to parking within the scope of Makassar City and to assist the city government in increasing Local Own Revenue (LOR). However, in practice, the presence of a parking regulation has yet to become a solution regarding this matter, such as public misunderstandings regarding parking fees, dissatisfaction with the performance of parking attendants in the field, and several other problems. This is due to the formation of regional regulations considered slow and do not see the community's needs. Concerning community participation in the formation of legislation, Law Number 32 of 2004 concerning Regional Regulations Article 139 paragraph (1) explicitly states provisions regarding community participation, as follows: 1 "The community has the right to provide input verbally or in writing in the framework of preparing or discussion of draft laws and draft regional regulations."

The success of regional governance must be connected to the active participation of the community, both in implementing the rules set by the local government and in the

process of forming their own rules. One of the forms of community participation in planning development is the involvement of the community in the formation of regional regulations.<sup>2</sup> The formation of good rules can be implemented by the community and in accordance with the needs of the community in the sense that it does not harm the community. The main objective of decentralization can be realized if the government "knows better" about the interests and needs of the people in the regions so that the policies or regulations formed are effective for the people.<sup>3</sup>

Community participation can contribute to producing regulatory plans that are more sensitive and more capable of articulating the needs of various diverse community groups without neglecting local wisdom. The lack of community participation regarding the formation of regional regulations will be formed by the Regional Government and the Regional House of Representatives of Makassar City so that the community does not receive information and cannot contribute to the formation of regional regulations. The formation of regional regulations with participatory principles in the concept used in this writing has the understanding that participatory legal products in the process of making provide a large role and full participation of existing organizations within the community so that the results are responsive or aspirational to community needs. The phenomenon of being marginalized or even neglecting community participation in forming local regulations, especially parking issues in Makassar City, has encouraged researchers to research participatory principles in forming regional regulations on parking in Makassar City.

#### **METHOD**

This study was juridical-empirical research. Empirical juridical research was legal research regarding enacting or implementing normative legal provisions in action in every particular legal event in society.<sup>5</sup> In other words, the study was conducted on the actual situation or real situation that occurred in the community to know and find the facts and data needed; the data collected was then identified and solved.<sup>6</sup> The population was the entire unit or object of research which could be humans, groups of people, or institutions. The purpose of holding a population was to determine the size of the sample

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Amir Muhiddin, Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Pembuatan Peraturan Daerah (Perda), Otoritas Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan Vol. III No. 1 April 2013, hal 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>Muhyar Nugraha, Latifah Ratnawaty, Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Daerah, Jurnal Yustisi Vol. 3 No. 1 Maret 2016, hal 33.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>Tomy M Saragih, "Konsep Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Daerah Rencana Detail Tata Ruang Dan Kawasan," *SASI* 17, no. 3 (2011), https://doi.org/10.47268/sasi.v17i3.361.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>Abdul Kadir Muhammad, Hukum dan Penelitian Hukum, Bandung, Citra Aditya Bakti 2004, hal. 134.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup>Bambang Waluyo, Penelitian Hukum Dalam Praktek, Jakarta, Sinar Grafika, 2002, hal. 15.

taken from members of the population and to limit the generalization area.<sup>7</sup> This study included several populations within the scope of the local government of Makassar City and the people of Makassar City. Then divided into several samples, namely the Regional Public Company of Parking Raya Makassar City, the Regional House of Representatives of Makassar City, and parking service users. The data was analyzed using the deductive method.

#### RESULT AND DISCUSSION

# 1. The form of community participation in forming the parking regulations in Makassar City

The process of forming a law can basically be divided into three stages, namely the ante-legislative stage, the legislative stage, and the post-legislative stage.<sup>8</sup> At each stage, the public can show their participation in forming laws and regulations.

# A. Community participation in the pre-legislative stage

At this stage, four forms of community participation can be carried out, namely:9

a) Community participation in the research form

Community participation in the research form can be carried out if the community has problems in the social environment that need to be studied and researched in depth and require the settlement of arrangements which are then made into laws. The study can be carried out independently or in collaboration with the government agencies in charge. The results of the study are then poured into a research format, which is then used as the basis for continuing the process of forming a law.

Based on interviews conducted with the Head of the General Division of the Regional Company of Parking Raya Makassar City, Mr. Asraruddin explained that:<sup>10</sup>

The Regional Company of Parking Raya Makassar City, in terms of drafting regional regulations, forms a team called a small committee which then works closely with experts (academicians) in designing academic texts. So far, the Regional Company of Parking Raya Makassar City has collaborated with Hasanuddin University in making academic papers and regional regulations. All matters relating to the formation of academic texts and regional regulations are

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup>Irwansyah, Penelitian Hukum (Pilihan Metode & Praktik Penulisan Artikel), Mirra Buana Media, Yogyakarta, 2020, hal 224

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup>Saifuddin, Partisipasi Public Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Perundang-Undangan. Yogyakarta. FH UII Press. 2009, h. 306

Saifuddin, Partisipasi Public Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Perundang-Undangan, h. 307.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup>Wawancara dengan kabag umum sekaligus panitia kecil pembentukan perda parkir pada PD parkir kota Makassar (Asraruddin) pada tanggal 16 Januari 2022

entirely given to academics to compile. Then, the small Committee of the Regional Company of Parking Raya Makassar City is tasked with providing the data needed by the academics. After the academic text and draft regional regulations were formed, the academics held a small meeting with the Regional Company of Parking Raya Makassar City to discuss the draft that had been formed. If there are still deficiencies, they are returned to the academics for revision and then reexamined. If it is deemed sufficient, it will proceed to the stage of submitting the Draft Regional Regulations to the legislative body of the Regional House of Representatives of Makassar City for further discussion.

b) Community participation in the discussion, workshop, and seminar forms

Discussions, workshops, and seminars can be carried out as a follow-up to the results of research on an object that will be regulated in the law. This activity made a major contribution to the study of the contents of the draft law because it was carried out by academics, observers, and experts in their respective fields. Discussions, workshops, and seminars enrich insight into the material that will be included in the draft law and can assist the process of putting it into academic texts.

After submitting academic papers and draft regional regulations to the Regional House of Representatives of Makassar City, according to a study conducted by researchers by interviewing parking attendants and the Makassar City community, there was no notification by the Regional Company of Parking Raya Makassar City or Regional House of Representatives in terms of any contents or the rules listed in the academic text. In accordance with the statement of Mr. Petrus as the general secretary of the *Serikat Juru Parkir Makassar* (English: Makassar Parking Service Association), hereinafter referred to as SJPM, said that:<sup>11</sup>

We, as parking attendants, have not been notified regarding the formation of the latest regional regulation that regulates parking in Makassar City. We also haven't got the Draft Regional Regulations script yet. Currently, a regional regulation is being formed regarding the change of Regional Company to Regional Company of Parking Raya Makassar City. The policy regulates the management of parking Regional Company. However, parking attendants should be involved in this formation because not all parking attendants necessarily agree with the change in status.

The researchers analyzed that while forming the latest parking regulation, namely the formation of the Makassar City parking regulation, various articles can be published in online media. It was stated that a new regional regulation related to

198

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup>Wawancara dengan sekertaris umum organisasi SJPM (petrus) pada tanggal 28 Januari 2022

parking in Makassar City would be formed, namely the formation of a parking regulation that was said to provide the best service for parking users, especially for the welfare of parking attendants in the field. However, the report does not attach academic papers that should be accessible to the wider community to find out the main rules in the new regional regulation.

c) Community participation in the initiative proposal forms

The submission of proposals for initiatives from the community can be submitted in two ways, namely: the President, House of Representatives and Regional Representative Council (for central government), Governor and Provincial Regional House of Representatives (for provincial regional governments), Regent and Regency Regional House of Representatives (for district regional governments). The latest Regional Regulation of Makassar City on parking is a proposal from the city government, especially the Regional Company of Parking Raya Makassar City, which was then withdrawn by Commission B of the Regional House of Representatives of Makassar City and made into a Regional House of Representatives initiation program. This is done in order to speed up the process of establishing a regional regulation.<sup>12</sup>

In this case, the draft regional regulation proposed by the parking Regional Company is not an initiative of the community but is based on the recommendation of Government Regulation Number 54 of 2017 concerning Regional Owned Enterprises, which divides into two parts, namely Regional Public Company and Regional Partnership Company. Therefore, based on this regulation, the parking Regional Company decides to submit the latest regional regulation to convert the Regional Company into a Regional Public Company, which, according to Asraruddin:

The change of the Regional Company into a Regional Public Company is to expand the reach of parking attendants and assist the regions in increasing the Local Own Revenue of Makassar City. This change is also social and creates fair and safe parking for the people of Makassar city.<sup>13</sup>

d) Community participation in the draft bill forms

The community in the last stage of the ante-legislative can carry out community participation in the draft bill forms. It means, by conducting research, and proposing initiatives, the community can use the research results in draft bills.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup>Wawancara dengan kabag umum sekaligus panitia kecil pembentukan perda parkir pada PD parkir kota Makassar (Asraruddin) pada tanggal 16 Januari 2022

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup>Wawancara dengan kabag umum sekaligus panitia kecil pembentukan perda parkir pada PD parkir kota Makassar (Asraruddin) pada tanggal 16 Januari 2022

The researchers analyzed that community participation was a form of drafting a bill in which the community took the initiative to form regional regulations proposals, which were then submitted to the Regional House of Representatives and the city government by conducting initial research and proposals. However, according to researchers, the people of Makassar City are mostly indifferent to the issue of proposing regulations. If certain people or organizations want or are willing to make suggestions, they will be constrained by knowledge and in-depth understanding regarding the formation of regulations.

#### B. Community participation in the legislative stage

At the legislative stage, the community can participate in six forms. In addition, the discussion of proposals or draft regulations is then discussed in meetings held by the Legislature, namely: $^{14}$ 

a) Community participation in audience/MMMF (Money Market Mutual Funds) forms in the House of Representatives

Community participation in the audience/MMMF (Money Market Mutual Funds) forms in the House of Representatives can be carried out by the community either at a direct request from the House of Representatives (MMMF) or at the request of the community itself (audience).

In relation to the study conducted by researchers regarding the discussion of the Draft Regional Regulation on the formation of a parking regulation, it should present people who are directly related to the formation of the regional regulation. In this case, parking attendants can be represented by parking attendant associations and parking user communities, who NGOs can represent to listen to their opinions concerning the formulation of the regional regulation, but in practice, they have not been involved in the discussion process of the Draft Regional Regulations.

According to interviews conducted with Muh Haedir, Director of Legal Aid Institute of Makassar City, stated that in the recent discussion of the regional regulation regarding parking, the Legal Aid Institute of Makassar did not receive an invitation to discuss the regional regulation. If there is a summons to attend a discussion meeting, we will attend; we will voice the rights of parking attendants, which so far have not been regulated in regional regulations.<sup>15</sup>

Romel Maradona AprillaWohff said that we, as parking attendants, should be included in the deliberation meeting because the regional regulations are directly

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup>Saifuddin, Partisipasi Public Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Perundang-Undangan, h. 311.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup>Wawancara dengan Direktur LBH Makassar, (Muh. Haedir) pada tanggal 27 Januari 2022

related to our work as parking attendants. We, who work in the field, are not the government. If we examine it further, at first, the parking lot existed because people asked the land owner or shop owner to turn their land or shop yard into a parking area which that person would then guard. Seeing the potential for parking in Makassar City, the government only looked at parking as a source of regional income for Makassar City. If you look at the history of parking attendants, they have an important role. Of course, they must be given the right to participate in the formation of parking regulations because the rules formed will later regulate our work as parking attendants.<sup>16</sup>

- b) Community participation in alternative draft bill forms
  - The community can participate in submitting alternative draft bill forms by drafting alternative bills when the bill currently being discussed by the House of Representatives has not or is not even aspirational for the interests of the wider community. The submission of this alternative draft bill must be carried out at the initial stage of deliberating the draft bill in the House of Representatives, namely simultaneously with the submission of the draft bill to the House of Representatives, both by the government and the House of Representatives itself. If the submission of a new alternative draft bill is proposed in the middle or even at the end of the discussion of a draft bill, then the target of presenting an alternative bill will not be effective in influencing the deliberation of a draft bill.
- c) Community participation in input through print media forms

  The community can carry out community participation in the input through print media forms by forming opinions on an issue being discussed by the Legislature. Public opinion can be in articles, press conferences, interviews, statements, or news headlines from newspapers and magazines. This form of participation is very practical. This is because the use of print media is considered practical and does not take up much of the public's time in providing criticism or suggestions, which then shows community participation in forming regulations.
  - Community participation in the input forms developed through print media. According to the researchers, it is very lacking, or even non-existent; the people do not understand and only think that the government's actions are appropriate and do not need further input.
- d) Community participation in input through electronic media forms

  The procurement of electronic media in helping dissemination or delivery to the public takes place more quickly, such as by conducting dialogue through

201

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup>Wawancara dengan ketua Serikat Juru parkir Makassar (SJPM) (Romel Maradona AprillaWohff) pada tanggal 28 Januari 2022

electronic media, which has a fast and wide reach and can encourage the public to participate in discussing issues concerning the wider community. The people of Makassar City cannot access the complaints through online media at this time. This is because the Regional Company of Parking Raya Makassar City has not provided an online media platform for the community. This is in line with Asraruddin's answer that currently, the Regional Company of Parking Raya Makassar City has not yet provided an online media platform in the form of a website and social media because it is still being planned.<sup>17</sup>

e) Community participation in demonstration forms

Community participation in demonstration forms can be carried out by the community in order to support, reject or suppress the material being discussed in the process of forming a law. The demonstrations are carried out both individually and in large groups of people. The effect of a demonstration will be more successful if it is carried out by a large number of interested people and is carried out sustainably.

The demonstrations carried out by SJPM have very often been held to reject the city government and Regional House of Representatives' policies related to city government decisions. The last demonstration regarding parking in Makassar City against the city government's policy of implementing e-parking is using machines given to parking attendants in parking in the field. Its use is considered to intimidate parking attendants due to the increased deposit rates charged to them.

f) Community participation in discussion, workshop, and seminar forms

Community participation in discussion, workshop, and seminar forms can be carried out by the community in order to obtain clarity on the issues being discussed by the Legislature. The discussions, workshops, and seminars are carried out when the formation process enters the stage of discussion by the Legislature. The speakers presented are not only experts, academics, experts, and observers, but it is better to bring in politicians directly involved in deliberating the draft bill. Therefore, holding discussions, workshops and seminars will give a complete picture of the issues being discussed in the legislative body.

# C. Community participation in the post-legislative stage

Community participation in the process of forming laws at the post-legislative stage can be carried out in the following forms:<sup>18</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup>Wawancara dengan kabag umum sekaligus panitia kecil pembentukan perda parkir pada PD parkir kota Makassar (Asraruddin) pada tanggal 16 Januari 2022

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup>Saifuddin, Partisipasi Public Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Perundang-Undangan, h. 314

## a) Demonstrations against the new law

The existence of a new law can cause differences of opinion from the public because it is possible that the presence of the law will not be a solution to problems but will instead create new problems in people's lives. The differences of opinion can be in the form of support or rejection of the birth of a new law manifested by demonstrations.

# b) Demand for review of the law

Every law formed by the Legislature, passed by the executive, and published in the state gazette has binding power and is legally valid in society. However, in a democratic country, including Indonesia, the people can respond. People who have not or are not satisfied with the enactment of the law can apply for a judicial review of the law. The existence of a judicial review of the law is in the context of maintaining the upholding of the constitution from abuse of power by the law-making organs. Therefore, the demands for judicial review of the law are the rights of the community, which must be guaranteed in realizing the existence of community rights and must be guaranteed in realizing public participation in the process of forming the law. In the history of the formation of regional regulations that regulate parking in Makassar City, there has been no application for testing.

# c) Socialization of the Law

In disseminating the product of the new law issued by the legislative body, the public can carry out various activities with the birth of a new law. These activities can be counseling, seminars, workshops, discussions, and so on. In this way, the existence of the law will not only be known to the elite who are directly involved in the process of forming the law but will also be quickly known to the wider community.

The regional regulation socialization is carried out by the executive, namely the Makassar City government, in this case, the Regional Company of Parking Raya Makassar City. However, according to Asraruddin, socialization can not be carried out because the mayor has not stipulated this latest regional regulation; it can be later.<sup>19</sup>

# 2. The legal implications of forming non-participatory regional regulations

#### A. Community legal awareness

According to Prof. Soerjono Soekanto, four indicators form legal awareness sequentially (step by step), namely:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup>Wawancara Dengan Kabag Umum Sekaligus Panitia Kecil Pembentukan Perda Parkir Pada PD Parkir Kota Makassar (Asraruddin) Pada Tanggal 16 Januari 2022

- a) Legal knowledge is a person's knowledge of certain behaviors regulated by written law, namely, what is prohibited and what is permitted. Based on the researchers' findings, legal knowledge, especially of parking attendants in Makassar City, is still lacking or even very minimal. It can be said that all parking attendants who conducted interviews with researchers said they knew of the existence of a regional regulation that regulates parking in Makassar City. Still, they did not know what the rules contained therein.
- b) Legal understanding is the amount of information a person owns regarding the contents of the (written) rules, namely the contents, purposes, and benefits of these regulations. Many people may know the law but do not necessarily understand the law. In providing legal understanding, in this case, coaching parking attendants are very important for them, especially in explaining their rights and obligations as parking attendants. In Regional Regulation No. 17 of 2006 concerning the Management of Public Roadside Parking in the Makassar City Area, it is explained in Chapter VI Article 11 that the directors are obliged to guide parking lot users and parking attendants.<sup>20</sup>

Directors have an obligation to parking users and attendants to provide guidance regarding the prohibitions and obligations of parking attendants in parking in the field. By looking at the last regional regulation regulating parking in Makassar City, Regional Regulation Number 17 of 2006, concerning the Management of Public Roadside Parking in the Makassar City Area, the researchers did not find a chapter or article that regulates the rights of parking attendants in working in the field.

# c) Legal attitude

So far, the pattern of legal behavior is based on the pattern that has become a habit for the community. This situation is often called the legal culture. If there are more law violations, tolerance, and mutual respect will decrease among fellow citizens in society, which inevitably results in a decline in government authority in the eyes of society. The decline in government authority can mean the inability of the legal structure to protect the community or create a sense of security for the community resulting in efforts by members of the community to protect or try to defend themselves (self-defense).

#### B. Community law compliance

 $<sup>^{20}\</sup>mbox{Pasal}$ 11 Perda Nomor 17 Tahun 2006 Tentang Pengelolaan Parkir Tepi Jalan Umum Dalam Daerah Kota Makassar

Robert Biersted, in his book "The Social Order," emphasizes that the process of a person's compliance with the rule of law occurs due to several factors. First, compliance with the law is instilled in a person intentionally (Indoctrination). Second, legal compliance due to habituation is someone's obedience to the rule of law because they are used to it, and it is a routine that they do. Third, the utilization of the rule of law obeyed (Utility) is someone who obeys the law because they can make substantive use of it. Fourth, identifying in a particular group (Group Identification) is a person's obedience to a rule or a law when he has seen other groups obeying or implementing the rule.

The types of compliance, according to Hans Kelsen, are as follows:<sup>22</sup>

- a) Compliance is when someone obeys a rule just because they fear punishment.<sup>23</sup> Makassar City Government has established Regional Regulation Number 11 of 1999 Series B Number 1 concerning Parking Fees on Public Roads, which is later renewed with the establishment of Regional Regulation Number 17 of 2006 concerning the Management of Parking on Public Roads in the Makassar City Area. Of the two regional regulations, no provisions bind the public to participate in forming the regional regulations. The chapters that regulate sanctions are only in the form of sanctions aimed at those who carry out parking; even more specifically, they only regulate sanctions regarding parking fees.
- b) Obedience (identification) is if someone obeys a rule just because they are afraid of damaging their good relationship with the other party.<sup>24</sup> This type of compliance can be found in parking user communities' interactions with parking attendants. People sometimes don't ask for a payment ticket from the parking attendant and give a wage that doesn't match the parking service fee stated on the payment ticket just because they feel sorry or it's intentional.
- c) Obedience (internalization) is someone obeying a rule because they feel it is in accordance with the intrinsic values they adhere to.<sup>25</sup> This type of compliance can be seen in some people who ask for a payment ticket from a parking attendant after using a parking service in a place. This is done to avoid the presence of illegal parking attendants.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup>Tauratiya Tauratiya, "Faktor Penyebab Timbulnya Kepatuhan Masyarakat Terhadap Hukum (Legal Obedience)," *ASY SYAR'IYYAH: JURNAL ILMU SYARI'AH DAN PERBANKAN ISLAM* 3, no. 2 (2018), https://dx.doi.org/10.32923/asy.v3i2.1169.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup>Achmad Ali, Menguak Tabir Hukum (Legal Theory) Dan Teori Peradilan (Judicialprudence) Termasuk Interpretasi Undang-Undang (Legisprudence) (Vol. 1; Jakarta: Kencana, 2009), h. 347-348.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Atang Hermawan Usman, "Kesadaran Hukum Masyarakat Dan Pemerintah Sebagai Faktor Tegaknya Negara Hukum Di Indonesia," *Jurnal Wawasan Hukum* 30, no. 1 (2014).

d) The interests of the community members (additional opinion from Soerjono Soekanto)<sup>26</sup>

# C. Legal Effectiveness

Based on the study and data obtained, the Makassar city parking regulations are ineffective. This can be seen from the low contribution of the Regional Company of Parking to the Local Own Revenue (LOR) of Makassar City.

**Table 6.** Contribution of Regional Company of Parking Raya Makassar City to the Local Own Revenue (LOR) of Makassar City

Year	Realization	Realization of	Contribution
	of Parking Regional	Local Own Revenue	(%)
	Company (Rp)	(LOR)	
2014	175.000.000	730.988.641.339	0,024 %
2015	160.000.000	828.871.892.853	0,019 %
2016	247.202.209	971.859.753.606	0,025%
2017	1.299.840.531	1.337.231.094.232	0,097%
2018	1.093.581.936	1.185.453.010.990	0,092%
Average (%)			0,052%

Source: Regional Financial and Asset Management Agency of Makassar City<sup>27</sup>

Basically, parking has a major contribution in donating Local Own Revenue (LOR). However, in practice, Parking Regional Company can only contribute an average of 0.052% to the Local Own Revenue of Makassar City, which in reality can be more than that due to the high number of existing vehicles within the scope of Makassar City.

#### CONCLUSION

The implications for forming regional regulations that do not use participatory principles can be seen from two sides, namely public legal awareness and community legal compliance. The community and parking attendants are aware but disobedient due to several factors, namely accessibility, legal knowledge, understanding of the law, patterns of legal behavior, and factors of the long-standing legal culture of the community. As a result, the effectiveness of forming regional regulations has not been effective because they have not fulfilled the participatory principle of forming

regional regulations. Collaborating with universities, NGOs, and organizations regarding the regional regulations that will be discussed providing legal knowledge and understanding to the public and parking attendants, including outreach, and providing a complaint platform for the public in providing suggestions and criticism in the formation of regional regulations being discussed and will be discussed which of course will be taken into consideration in the formation of regulations.

#### REFERENCES

#### Book:

- Ali, Achmad Menguak Tabir Hukum (Legal Theory) Dan Teori Peradilan (Judicialprudence) Termasuk Interpretasi Undang-Undang (Legisprudence) Vol. 1 Pemahaman Awal. Jakarta. Kencana. 2009.
- Amiruddin dan Zainal Asikin, Pengantar Metode Penelitian Hukum, PT Raja Grafindo Persada, Jakarta, 2006.
- Bambang Waluyo, Penelitian Hukum Dalam Praktek, Jakarta, Sinar Grafika, 2002
- Burhan Ashshofa, Metode Penelitian Hukum, Rineka Cipta, Jakarta, 2007
- Halim, Hamzah dan Kemal Redindo Syahrul Putera, Cara Praktis Menyusun & Merancang Peraturan Daerah (Suatu kajian teoretis & praktis disertai manual) konsepsi teoretis menuju artikulasi empiris, Kencana Prenada Media Grup, Jakarta. 2009.
- Irwansyah, Penelitian Hukum (Pilihan Metode & Praktik Penulisan Artikel), Mirra Buana Media, Yogyakarta, 2020
- Muhammad, Abdul Kadir. Hukum dan Penelitian Hukum. Bandung, Citra Aditya Bakti 2004.
- Saifuddin. Partisipasi Public Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Perundang-Undangan. Yogyakarta. FH UII Press. 2009.
- Soerjono Soekanto, Pengantar Penelitian Hukum, Universitas Indonesia Press, Jakarta, 1986.
- Syahruddin Nawi, Penelitian Hukum Normatif Versus Penelitian Hukum Empiris, Umitoha Ukhuwah Grafika, Makassar, 2014

#### Journal:

- Hermawan Usman, Atang. "Kesadaran Hukum Masyarakat Dan Pemerintah Sebagai Faktor Tegaknya Negara Hukum Di Indonesia." Jurnal Wawasan Hukum 30, no. 1 (2014).
- Monoarfa, Ryan. "Partisipasi Publik Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Daerah." LEX ADMINISTRATUM 1, no. 2 (2013).
- Nurmiati, dkk. Kajian Kontribusi PD Parkir dan PD. Pasar Tehadap Pendapatan Asli Daerah Kota Makassar, Jurnal Inovasi dan Pelayanan Publik Makassar, Volume 1, Nomor 1, Januari-Juni 2019.
- Saragih, Tomy M. "Konsep Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Daerah Rencana Detail Tata Ruang Dan Kawasan." SASI 17, no. 3 (2011). https://doi.org/10.47268/sasi.v17i3.361.
- Seta, Salahudin Tunjung. "Hak Masyarakat Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Perundang-Undangan." Jurnal Legislasi Indonesia 17, no. 2 (2020). https://doi.org/10.54629/jli.v17i2.530.
- Tauratiya, Tauratiya. "Faktor Penyebab Timbulnya Kepatuhan Masyarakat Terhadap Hukum (Legal Obedience)." ASY SYAR'IYYAH: JURNAL ILMU SYARI'AH DAN PERBANKAN ISLAM 3, no. 2 (2018). https://dx.doi.org/10.32923/asy.v3i2.1169.

## Regulation:

- Indonesia, Republik. "Undang-Undang No. 32 Tahun 2004 Tentang Pemerintah Daerah." CWL Publishing Enterprises, Inc., Madison 2004 (2004).
- Perda Nomor 17 Tahun 2006 Tentang Pengelolaan Parkir Tepi Jalan Umum Dalam Daerah Kota Makassar