

EXPLORING MODEL OF TEACHING USED BY THE LECTURERS AT THE FIFTH SEMESTER OF ENGLISH EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

Arinda Nurul Widyaningrum

Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar
arindanurul0@gmail.com

Muhammad Yaumi

Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar
muhammadyaumi@gmail.com

Kamsinah

Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar
kakinauin@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The lecturer is one of the needs in the educational process. In carrying out the professionalism, they should prepare appropriate model of teaching to support learner's achievement. This study sought to explore how the lecturer in English Education Department prepare and implement their model of teaching and what students' perception. It utilized a phenomenological design inquiry with a qualitative approach. Participants in this research were lecturers and students. They were taken purposively. The data were collected through an observations sheet, interview guide, focus group discussion, and document study. The observation, interview, and document study were done to the lecturers, and the focus group discussion was done to the students. As a result, three lecturers of the English Education Department used a different model of teaching. The first lecturer used the cooperative learning model, the second lecturer used the multi skill strategy, and the third lecturer used the blended learning model. Besides, students had various perception of each model of teaching was implemented by the lecturer. They shared the positive and negative perception.

Keywords: Teaching model, lecturer, students' perception, students of English language teaching

INTRODUCTION

In the college environment, the lecturer is one of the needs. They play an important role in helping create better human resources. It is stated in the Ministry of National Education No. 14/U/2005 article 1. The lecturer is a professional educator and scientist with the main task of transforming, developing, and disseminating knowledge, technology, and art through the educational process, research field, and dedication in society.

Next, in carrying out the professionalism, lecturers should design their learning process. Lecturers are obligated to plan, implement the process of learning, assess, and evaluate the

learning outcomes. Therefore, good preparation is required before conducting teaching processes.

In preparing a good quality of teaching, the lecturer can select and design an appropriate teaching model. This preparation is very crucial in the learning and teaching process. The teaching model contains a set of activities that support learner's achievement either in the cognitive, psychomotor, or affective domain.

Kilbane and Milman (2014) stated that teacher needs to be a designer in the educational process. It purposes to facilitate learners in learning. The designer here means a person who facilitates learners with appropriate instruction and models based on learners' needs.

The study about the use of the model in enhancing learners' achievement is not a brand-new idea. Attempts have been made to investigate certain models' usage in a particular lesson to support the learning and teaching process. Ostad and Soleymannpour (2014) reported implementing a model of learning in Rezyanshahr city (Guilan Iran). Their study investigates the effect of concept attainment teaching method and mastery teaching method on Female High School Students' Academic Achievement and Metacognitive Skills. This research showed a difference between experimental groups with the control group, which is concept attainment teaching and mastery teaching equally give the impact of academic achievement and metacognitive skills of students.

Rubiah (2016), for example, conducted research and development about the *Problem Based Learning Model* in SMA Banda Aceh with a descriptive statistical data analysis technique using a questionnaire survey of students regarding information mushroom. In her research, she did common research and development steps, namely the planning stage, the implementation phase, and the data analysis stage. The product of this research is a teaching material related to fungal biology, mushroom-based approaches to the problem. It was based on the need analysis of the learner. Therefore, it is considered being as effective as reading material about the concept of mushrooms. As a result, the final product of problem-based biology teaching material is considered very useful as reading material for the concept mushroom.

Besides, many people believed that using a particular model in the learning process is important specifically to the instructor. In Alansari's (2016) research, *Implementation of Cooperative Learning in The Center for Community Service and Continuing Education at for Community Service and Continuing Education at Kuwait University*, in this research 200 university teacher showed their experience and arguments about the effect of the cooperative learning model in the classroom, how it contributes to the achievement, and how their students'

attitude about it. As the result about 75% of that teacher believed about the implementation of the cooperative learning model can give successfully for students' achievement. This research supports the view that collective learning experiences promote positive attitudes toward the instructional experience and allow students to develop skills in group interactions and work with others needed in today's world.

From some research above, it is generally informed that choosing or designing models are important. It is crucial to design carefully based on the learners' needs. Thus, this research would concentrate on exploring different aspects. The researcher would not see the effect of a particular teaching model, but she aimed to explore some teaching model that the lecturer tried to implement in the classroom. The researcher was interested in gaining more information about preparing the teaching model by the lecturers. This research also informed about the steps of the teaching model and explained the lecturer's perspective of how students learning in the English Education Department. Therefore, it would deliver information clearly about the learning and teaching process to occur.

METHOD

This research used a phenomenological design with a qualitative approach. According to Bogdan and Taylor (1975), qualitative methodologies refer to research procedures which produce descriptive data: people's own written or spoken words and observable behaviour. While according to Cresswell (2014) phenomenological design inquiry coming from philosophy and psychology. Relation to this study, phenomenology used to reveal the facts, indication, and events objectively related to the models of teaching used by the lecturer.

The data source is the location where data were taken. In this research, the researcher took two data sources. Primary Data Sources are data sources that directly provide data to the researcher. In this study, data were obtained directly from the informants closely related to the research problem. The data primary sources were the lecturer in the fifth semester categorized into government employees at State Islamic University of UIN Alauddin Makassar and the students at the fifth semester of English Education Department. Secondary Data sources are data sources that do not directly provide data to the researcher, such as other people or documents. The secondary data sources in this research were obtained from the documents.

In this research, the researcher took data sources by using purposive sampling. According to Gay (2012), Purposive Sampling, also referred to as judgement sampling, is the process of selecting a sample that is believed to be representative of a given population.

The data were taken from the interview, observation, document analysis, and focus group discussion. observations were aimed at the lecturers, students in the classroom. It aimed to see the real implementation of the teaching model in the classroom, such as the role of lecture in the classroom and every step in the model of teaching that lecture implemented. The observation was conducted three times for each lecture. the interview was addressed to lecturers.

The researcher conducted face to face interviews with participants. It purposed to explore their deep explanations, views, and ideas of their performance in implementing teaching models in the classroom. Therefore, in interviewing these participants, the researcher used semi-structured interviews to ask questions using the open-ended question.

Focus group discussion to gain information from students related to their perspective about the teaching model was implemented by their lecturer. Therefore, participants that categorized in this research were students who experienced those teaching models. During the research process, the research also collected qualitative documents to ensure the validity of the data.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Model of Teaching Used by the Lecturers

Cooperative Teaching Model

Based on the interview, the lecturer said that she used the cooperative learning model, and the specific activity used was the group presentation. The cooperative learning model's basic tenet emphasized collaborative work among students and collaborative plans to present the lesson to other groups. It was her explanation:

Based on the constructivist view of learning, we can use various teaching methods, such as presentation one by one, jigsaw, discussion. However, I mostly used the cooperative learning model

The reason of using Cooperative Teaching model were because it is suitable model for the larger class context and, all students can participate at the same time because they work in a group. These were her statements:

In the Indonesian class context, which has a big class, constructivism is an appropriate model, but we still can use various methods. For example, we can use presentations one by one, jigsaw discussion, etc.

Actually, students present the lesson one by one, so everyone should talk. Classifying students in a group aims to shorter time so that it would be more efficient. Efficient means when we use the shortest time but get the best results.

Based on the observation, there were three teaching sequences in the cooperative learning model. The first is organizing a lesson plan, the second is implementing the cooperative learning, the third is group presentation, and the last is evaluation.

In this teaching model, the lecturers' role was as facilitator and motivator. She facilitated students with some learning sources, and then students did group exploration and individual learning. The lecturer also tried to motivate students to be a good teacher. She explained and described the current issue in teaching language. The lecturer hoped that students could study hard for a better teaching future.

Supporting system need in this teaching model was projector. Without the projector, it was tough to display the findings clearly. Therefore, it was important to provide an attractive visual form to help students catch the group presenter's message. The lecturer argued that the projector could benefit from sharing the larger class content as a supporting tool in learning

Multi Skills Strategy

The lecturer said in the interview, the multi-skills strategy had a concept to improve students' language skills and knowledge of the language. There were several skills tried to be improved by the lecturer, such as speaking, reading, and writing skills. Besides, he also tried to increase student's literacy skill. Because, the lecturer assumed that students were lack of literacy. They were careless to read books and literature. Therefore, to overcome this problem, the lecturer gave pre-questioning technique. He prepared several questions for each meeting, then ordered students to answers all questions at home with their own writing.

Sometimes, they could not express their opinions because of their limitation about the two things I mentioned before. So, students cannot talk effectively, and the second students do not have enough knowledge of the language.

By allowing them the opportunity to answer questions, they will indeed begin by reading. They practice and answer the questions in the form of group discussions. They have the chance to internalize the knowledge obtained from the process of getting answers to questions. And that will be repeated when they enter the class.

Based on the observation, there were three teaching sequences in the multi skills strategy designed by the lecturer. The first was form group. Students were divided into several groups. They were grouping heterogeneously so the students can learn to build communication and collaborative skills with their friends. The second was outside classroom group discussion. Students must ask and discuss each other about their own writing. They must share the answer that they found in some literature so that the speaking process was conducted. The third was classroom group discussion. It was divided into three parts. The first part was an internal group discussion, which students discussed in their group. The second part was the external group

discussion in which several students moved into other groups. The last part was a general group discussion that all students in the classroom could express their ideas together.

In the observation, it showed that lecturers' role in this class was as a facilitator. The choice of focus group discussion method becomes evidence that his priorities emphasize students' learning process. It showed that the lecture's position was only to facilitate and give students many opportunities to learn. He was also as a motivator for the students. He was continually transferred motivation and value of life during the learning process. Besides, as a lecturer he was also contribute to knowledge development by intensively write a book related to the current issues in education. In teaching, according to him, book and projector were become essential supporting tools in the class, because it aimed to display material clearly and interestingly.

Blended Learning Model

From the interview, the lecturer said that the blended learning model was a model that balances the portion of the face to face and online learning. Therefore, students learned through direct experience with the lecturer and their classmates and learned with their learning content in different place through online discussion. The type of blended learning used by the lecturer was called rotation model.

The type of Blended learning that I use is the rotation type. This rotation type means the lesson was studied in the classroom, could be continued through online learning.

Blended learning was an innovative concept that embraces the advantages of both traditional teachings in the classroom and ICT supported learning, including both offline learning and online learning. Automatically, the Blended Learning Model provided several interactions in the learning process. In implementing blended learning model, there were two teaching sequences. The first, face to face learning, and the second.

There were two teaching sequences in blended learning model. The first was face to face learning, and the second was online learning. In the face-to-face learning, the lecturer implemented cooperative and problem-based learning method. While in the online learning, the lecturer gave individual project and online classroom discussion.

From the interview, it showed that the main reason of implementing blended learning model were to provide simultaneous interaction, and to develop students' learning domain. Lecturers' role in this teaching model were as facilitator and guidance. The lecturer facilitated students to learn in various ways and sources by utilizing technology, and guided students to design media of learning, such as blog. Supporting system needed in the blended learning

model were projector, internet connector, and some learning application such as Moodle and Mind Maple.

Students' Perception about Model of Teaching Implemented by the Lecturers

Cooperative Teaching Model

a. Being Motivated to Learn

The first time, when the class begin, I felt that summarize the lesson helped me to be an enthusiast in learning. I usually read my summarization task before the class take place (...)

The resume assignment helps me because we will not be confused as the audiences while listening to the group presenter explained the lesson. Besides, like when we are walking, we will not run if not chased, and I think this summary persuaded us to keep running forward and do the next step of learning.

From statement above, it suggested that teaching sequences in cooperative teaching model motivated students to learn. For example, the resume assignment that leads students to understand the material before classroom discussion took place. Besides, resume assignment help student did internalization of material, and increase their eagerness of learning

b. The Language's Difficulty Level

In my opinion, sometimes in doing summarization task, I found many problems. Especially when I start to read the handbook from the lecturer and find many difficult words. Sometimes, I rewrite all the handbooks because I do not understand what the written explanation.

Whenever I do my resume assignment, I found a problem in understanding the handbook. Some words used are too academic. That is a book written by Brown. That book explained the lesson in a complicated way and used too much academic word. So, I must read back the book to get the main point from the text. Besides, I think reading and resume the text from 20 pages into three pages are not easy.

Based on the findings, the researcher assumed that the problem above emerged from the personal factor. Students who difficult to understanding some English academic vocabularies reflected their intensity in reading English literature. If students rarely learn new academic vocabulary, they will find it hard to read English textbooks full of academic words.

c. Highlighting on Students-Centred Approach

The lecturer was focus on the students, so we never felt stress in the learning process. We were treated like a friend, so we do much sharing. The lecturer never positioned herself as a, not as a lecturer, but she acts like a sharer, person who share her knowledge.

I felt that the lecturer what is, she treated us like what we want. She is really welcoming with all suggestion, really open-minded. So, if there is something that we do not really like, such as learning method, she will accept the suggestion at the end of the meeting.

The researcher argued that it was in line with the basic principle of the cooperative teaching model that put students into the centre of learning. When the learning process was focus on the students, they would be more excited to learn. When students were treated well by the lecturer, it will affect the students' mood. They would enjoy learning without being stress

d. The lecturer's Subject Matter Knowledge

I really enjoy the way she explains the lesson. It becomes much more understandable. Therefore, if I hardly understand all English textbooks, I will directly ask the lecturer questions. Until today, I can remember anything from what she explained than what I read from the book.

I loved the way she taught us. I loved this lesson and lecturer. She is smart. It could be seen from the way she answered all question perfectly and calmly. She was always using a proper language, clear explanation, followed by many examples. So that when we asked something, we will be delighted with the answer.

The researcher assumed that subject matter competence becomes an essential skill in teaching. The lecturer knew about the lesson, concept, terms, organizing ideas, connecting ideas, and delivering some examples. In other words, understanding of the subject matter is an important part of being a competent teacher

e. Less Practice

Actually, in the learning contract, we will learn the theory and then practice. However, the fact is different. We did the discussion too much. Actually, I want to practice more than theory because this lesson's output is how to make a product. Such as how to make and validate the assessment of learning, and then test it directly on the students. Nevertheless, we did not do that. We only learn how to assess with the limited time.

The finding above showed the urgency of carefully designing teaching models based on students' need because it affected the students' learning outcome. The effective teaching model is a model that can enable students to gain particular skill and knowledge. When students were aware that they lost particular skill and knowledge that they expected, it means there were incomplete or inappropriate items in the previous step of teaching model design.

f. Objective Assessment

She is very objective in evaluating students. She never sees who you are, but she always sees how much effort you do in this learning process.

So, she never judged students by seeing their final test only. Yes, she observed students from the first process of learning, until the end. She paid full attention to students' progress of learning and gave a suitable score for their effort. That was the thing that I loved from her.

The researcher agreed with this principle of being objective in assessing students. Because assessment is an ongoing process, it is more than just giving a test or assigning grades. Students could not be assessed just based on list presence or final test. Because assessment is everything, a teacher does determine if her or his students are learning.

Multi Skills Strategy

a. Language Skill Improvement

The method used by the lecturer is appropriate because this method always train us to be brave in speaking. Actually, the teaching method prepared us before coming to the class and share our ideas with others.

In my opinion, this method implemented by the lecturer was good. It is a brilliant method because it helps students train their four speaking skills, namely reading, speaking, writing, and listening. In my view, this is a very effective method used.

From all extracts above, the researcher argued that mastering the subject and solid core of teaching skill was important to be a lecturer. Students' feedback above, which informed their ease in learning, reflected how well the lecture carefully designed the teaching procedures.

b. Discipline in Learning

I learnt how to be a good time manager. So, I came earlier before the class began. That was a good impact to myself. I also agreed with the principle of honesty that always implemented in this class. This motivation also affected om my behaviour.

I really like the lecturer's discipline. We are taught to be disciplined with time, attendance, and other rules. This rule affected me. Since one semester, he signed students who came late. Therefore, I tried to manage my time. I tried to be a discipline. At seven and thirty minutes, I should be in the class to not be late.

The above explanations informed that the lecturer needs to have a good technique for helping students become self-motivated and take responsibility for their learning. From all extracts above, it also reflected the lecturer's effort to maintain students' good habit through modelling and to serve punishment for them who break the rule.

c. Lecturer's Subject Matter Knowledge

Actually, my lecturer is broad-minded; he is prosperous of experiences and knowledge. Why do I tell this statement? Because at the first meeting, he just told about experiences to us, but after that, he began to explain the subject and focused on the track. He intentionally asked questions in every classroom discussion that the answers are always relevant to many disciplines. He is explained psycholinguistic side itself and makes it broader to another subject such as linguistic side. He is a very broader minded lecturer.

The statement above showed that students were amazed by the lecturer's ability to master the subject and know how to explain the subject. Therefore, it affected students' enthusiasm in learning like what had been observed by the researcher.

d. The Language's Difficulty Level

I think the vocabulary used in this book is still complicated to understand, unlike the book from other lecturers that are easy for students to understand. The book that this lecturer used the main learning source is difficult to understand. So, I think the lecturer should adjust the book that suitable with the foreigner learners.

Based on student's perception above the researcher assumed that it was related to a personal problem. Difficult to understand the book because of the limitation of vocabulary was the personal factor. Based on the focus group discussion, other students did not have such a

perception. They even said that the book used in this teaching model was good because the native speaker wrote it. It could also help students improve their knowledge of vocabulary

e. Proper Facilitation from the Lecturer

The lecturer recommended a book to be our resource. He prepared all books from the book store by himself, so that we as a student are not difficult to find appropriate resources for this subject anymore.

I think he is the only one lecturer who was maximizing technology of learning in this case. He knows that our university has a limited learning media stock, such as a projector, and LCD. Thus, he decided to bring his own technology from home to maximize the process of transfer knowledge.

From some perceptions above, the students described how well this lecturer organized the references for learning started from considering the level of need, physical appearance, and the completeness. Therefore, it indicated that selecting appropriate learning resources for students become an important part of teaching.

f. Motivation in Learning

If I had to prefer which one of the lecturer's character needs to be followed, I would choose these two characters. First, influential person. I saw that most of my friends preferred research relevant to what had been taught by the lecturer. It is a fact. Then, secondly, he is always emphasized about the importance of honesty.

In the learning process, Alhamdulillah, I was proud of the way he taught us. Because the lecturer provided us with material and taught us about our religion, that was the positive side.

Based on all extracts above, it showed that the lecture's good communication skill helped students achieve the goal of learning. The lecturer provided students with motivational and encouraged them to get better performance. This motivational skill needed to be mastered by the lecturer

Blended Learning Model

a. Providing Different Learning Experiences

After I shared my blog view to my friends in this online learning, I receive good feedback. My friend said, "Wow, it is a good blog, did you make it?" Then I said, "Yes, this is my final test". My friend responded, "Yes, I am sure it is a good job." So, it looked like I get meaningful learning. Also, this online learning task is more manageable. It is less paper which enables us to access whenever we need easily.

Based on the focus group discussion, students revealed that the blended learning model provided new learning experiences. Students were getting change to create meaningful learning. When teachers use technology, it can enhance and enrich their performances of understanding. Word processors, digital audio and video technologies for creating Web sites allow students to express their understanding in a wide variety of media. These technologies also capture student work in forms that can be easily revised, combined, and distributed.

b. Engaging Students to Participate in the Learning Process.

This online learning is good because we can share our ideas by writing that it cannot be stated. The lecturer facilitated us in stating our ideas in online learning. Because not all students can participate in the classroom discussion, they have to do that in the online discussion.

It is likely showed that students get to benefit from the simultaneous interaction in the blended learning model. Students can interact with classmates inside the college campus and also in virtual space. They also can get feedback from the lecturer both in the classroom and in virtual space

c. Unclear Lesson Plan in the Offline Learning

Actually, the learning process implemented by the lecturer is good, seriously. However, I think we lack information from the first very meeting with the lecturer (...)

From the perception revealed above, it can be concluded that communicating the lesson plan with students at the beginning course was the important part. Students should know what and how their activity in the class. The lecturer also needs to decide what and how he or she would teach in the class.

d. Too Much Classroom Activities

I think the methods used in this class are too much. It might be efficient when the lecturer only used one. For example, the lecturer should decide whether using mind mapping, group presentation, practice to design lesson plans, or practising how to make the blog. I think when we focus on one activity or one way, it might be effective. It is too much. Actually, it makes us a student think too much.

The statement above likely showed that the students were not still received about the lesson plan's clear information. Students need to understand their lesson plan designed by the lecturer, such as what specific purposes of each activity and how they should participate in that activity. It might help students internalize the plan and manage their several tasks because they understood each goal of activity in the classroom.

e. Being Easier to Learn

I think that he is very patience and have a good sense of humour in the classroom. He knows the class situation and how to handle all students. For example, when students sometimes lose concentration, the lecturer gives us some jokes, sometimes irrelevant to the course, but interesting. It can make us focused again into the course and the lecturer.

The extracts above indicated that the lecturer needs to build good interaction and facilitation to learn easier. Students' perception above showed that the lecturer was caring, and have a sense of humour that bring students into positive emotions and enthusiasm in learning. When students were comfortable with the lecturer's positive attitude in the class, they would respect the lecturer and become motivated to learn.

f. Good Facilitation from the Lecturer

The lecturer facilitates us with a projector, but some students play their phone, some are busy with their business. However, when we give attention to the lesson, we can easily understand it. Because the lecturer explained it step by step. He even not just explaining, but monitoring the student's progress of learning. When students have understood the first lesson, the lecturer will continue into the next lesson. For example, the lecturer explained how to make a headline in our blog, comment on the blog, etc. It is clear and easier to understand, but sometimes some students did not concentrate on that lesson.

Student's statement above showed that students could benefit from the lecturer who spends more time explaining and demonstrating new material. Because the students could understand the difficulty of learning independently, getting students to know about the technology or internet can be a valuable tool for helping students learn.

CONCLUSION

Based on the data obtained through observation and interview, the researcher found that three lecturers used different teaching model in their classroom. These models were designed based on several considerations about students need. The first lecturer used the cooperative learning model, the second lecturer used multi skills strategy, and the third lecturer used blended learning model. Based on the focus group discussion, students' perception about each model of teaching implemented by the lecturer have variation. They shared positive and negative perception. From this research, the suggestion addressed to the student teacher. To be an educator, it is important to be an educational designer. Designer in here means a person who facilitate learners with appropriate instruction and model based on learners needs. The lecturer needs to be intentional. Intentionality means doing things for a reason, on purpose. They are constantly thinking about outcomes they want for their students and about how each decision they make moves children toward those outcomes. Therefore, the student teacher, or students who studying to be a teacher need to aware with the teaching model development to prepare their future teaching.

REFERENCES

- Ahadi. (2009). "Quran surah Al Hashr 18 (QS 59: 18) in Arabic and English translation".
- Ahmad and Mohammed. (2011). Holy Qur'an Translated into English. Egyptian: Dar El Shorouk.
- Alansari, M. Eissa. (2016). *Implementation of cooperative learning in the Centre for Community Service and Continuing Education at Kuwait University*. Retrieved from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ797597.pdf> (23 July 2018)

- Al-tabani, Ibnu Badar Trianto. (2017). *Mendesain Model Pembelajaran Inovatif, Progresif, dan Kontekstual*. Cetakan 3. Jakarta: PT Kharisma Putra Utama.
- Al-tabani, Ibnu Badar Trianto. (2014). *Mendesain Model Pembelajaran*. Jakarta: Pernadamedia.
- Asmawati, Nur. (2018). "Model of English Learning Based on Collaborative Theory to Improve Indonesian' spoken communication ability", Thesis (Palu: Fak. Tarbiyah dan Keguruan IAIN Palu)
- Bogdan, Robert and Taylor, Steven, J. (1975). *Introduction to Qualitative Research Method*. Canada: A Wiley Inter science publication.
- Creswell, Jhon W. (2014). *Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Method Approaches*. USA: SAGE publication.
- Gay, L.R. (2012). *Educational Research: Competencies for analysis and applications*. 10th Edition. USA: Pearson Education Inc.
- Geoffrey E. Mills, L.R. Gay. (2016). *Educational Research: Competencies for Analysis and Applications*. 11th Edition. USA: Pearson Education Inc.
- Hakim, Abdul Yassi and Kaharuddin. (2018). *Syllabus Design for English Language Teaching*. Second Edition. Jakarta: Prenadamedia Grup.
- Herdiansyah, Haris (2013). *H M.Si. Wawancara, Observasi dan Focus Group Sebagai Instrumen Penggalan Data Kualitatif*. Jakarta: PT. Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Hidayat, Julkifli. (2016). "The Contribution of Teacher Pedagogical Competence Toward The Effectiveness of Teaching of English at Mtsn Balang-Balang". Thesis (Makassar: Fak. Tarbiyah dan Keguruan UIN Alauddin).
- Joyce, Bruce, Marsha, Weil, & Emily, Calhoun. (2015). *Model of Teaching*. United States of America: Pearson Education.
- Kasilinga Gowrishankar et al. (2014). "Assessment of Learning Domains to Improve Student's Learning in Higher Education." *Journal of Young Pharmacists*, Vol 6 (4). p.29. <http://researchgate.net>.
- Kilbane, R. Clare, Natalie B. Milman. (2014). *Teaching Model*. United States of America: Pearson Education.
- Larsen, Diane. (2000). *Techniques and Principles in Language Teaching*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Miles Mathew B, A. Michael Huberman. (2014). *Qualitative Data Analysis*. USA: Sage Publications Inc, 3rd edition.
- Ostad, and Soleymanpour, Javad. (2014). *The Impact of Concept Attainment Teaching Models and Mastery Teaching Method on Female High School Students' Academic Achievement*

and Metacognitive Skills. International Journal of Innovative Research in Science, Engineering, and Technology.

Richards, C Jack. (1986). *Approach and Methods in Language Teaching*. Australia: Cambridge University Press.

Rubiah, Musriadi. (2016). "Implementation of Problem Based Learning Model in Concept Learning Mushroom as a Result of Student Learning Improvement Efforts Guidelines for Teachers" Journal of Education and Practice.

Rusman. (2011). *Model-Model Pembelajaran, Mengembangkan Profesionalisme Guru*. Jakarta: PT Raja Grafindo Persada.

Saunders, Amanda. (2008). "Does Cooperative Learning Increase Participation in the Classroom?". Education Masters Paper 117. <https://fisherpub.sjfc.edu/>. (21 June 2018)

Slavin, Robert. (2006). *Educational Psychology: Theory and Practice*. United States of America: Pearson Education.

Sugiyono. (2008). *Memahami Penelitian Kualitatif*. Cetakan ke 4: Bandung: CV. Alfabeta.

Wasis D. Dwiyoogo. (2018). *Pembelajaran Berbasis Blended Learning*. Depok: Rajawali.

Yaumi, Muhammad. (2013). *Action Research: Teori, Model, dan Aplikasi*. Makassar: Alauddin University Press.

Yusny Rahmat. (2013). *ELT in Indonesian Context: Issues and Challenges*, no. 1. <http://jurnal.ar-raniry.ac.id>.