

# COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF THE TRADITIONAL ISLAMIC EDUCATION SYSTEM AND THE MODERN ISLAMIC EDUCATION SYSTEM IN INDONESIA

**Muhammad Aminullah, Bahaking Rama, Abbas Baco  
Miro; Tabhan Syamsu Rijal**

Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar, Universitas Bosowa

Email: muhammadaminullag662@gmail.com,

bahaking.rama@unismuh.ac.id,

abbas.bacomiro@unismuh.ac.id;

samsu.rijal@universitasbosowa.ac.id

**Abstract:** The research aims to analyze the comparison of the traditional Islamic education system with the modern Islamic education system in Indonesia. The results of this research show that the traditional Islamic education system in Indonesia is education carried out by educators using old methods. Traditional Islamic education is known as the Halaqah system and does not use alternatives such as benches, tables and blackboards. While the modern Islamic education system in Indonesia is education that is based on the concept of divinity but is universal, modern Islamic education does not only focus on religious lessons but is also integrated with science and technology with a classical system, namely using tables, chairs, blackboards and other learning media. The comparison between these two systems is found in their educational institutions. In the curriculum aspect, traditional Islamic education has its curriculum from the kyai or top leaders of the institution, while the curriculum in modern Islamic education is an integrated curriculum from educational institutions (Mendikbutristek) and religious institutions (Kemenag).

**Keywords:** System Comparison, Traditional Islamic Education, Modern Islamic Education

## **INTRODUCTION**

Islamic education developed along with the emergence of the Islamic religion and at the beginning of its development as an institution, a formal education system had not been implemented systematically. The condition of education at that time was still informal and focused more on efforts to propagate Islam. Initially the education process was carried out in a place in the form of a halaqah (learning circle). Then the emergence of formal Islamic education occurred with the existence of madrasas and other Islamic schools. The presence of Islam, both as a religion and an educational institution, has created an axis of civilization based on universal aqidah and moral values with the aim of creating *Baldatun Thoyyibatun Wa Robbun Ghofur*.

In Indonesia, Islamic education has experienced dynamic development, due to the tug-of-war between the demands of fulfilling the ideal expectations of the Muslim community who are stakeholders and the empirical reality of socio-economic and political changes that encourage adjustments. Islamic education has been present and developed in the archipelago since Islam entered this country, brought by wandering Sufis or traders from the Middle East who then lived as one with the local population through a process of adapting to the ways of life and traditions they had previously carried out.

One of the effective means for developing and developing people in society is regular, efficient and effective education. Therefore, Islamic education needs to be

organized and managed with neat, effective and efficient management through appropriate systems and methods. However, many educators or people involved in the world of Islamic education do not know what the system and methods of Islamic education are, while Islamic education methods have been applied by the Prophet such as Ta'lim and others for a long time, but educators are not aware of this. So there are still many imperfections in Islamic education.

The development of education is greatly influenced by developments over time. For this reason, changes in education must be relevant to changing times and the needs of society in that era, both in concepts, materials and curriculum, processes, functions and goals of educational institutions. In essence, science was created to try to solve every problem related to human problems, including in Islamic education, the differences in needs and problems that arise require continuous changes in developing science and once again this is included in the science of Islamic education.

In order to achieve effective Islamic education to foster and develop people in society and be efficient and successful. Therefore, Islamic education needs to be organized or managed neatly, effectively and efficiently through appropriate systems and methods. The dynamics of Islamic education over time have certainly experienced many changes. Both from the development of education and the educational institutions within it. That is the cycle of development of changes in education, otherwise education will be left behind by changing times, for this reason

education must be relevant to changing times and the needs of society in that era, both in concepts, materials and curriculum, processes, functions and goals of educational institutions. That's why, the author is enthusiastic about exploring the differences in these characteristics. With the review above, the author would like to raise the title "Comparative analysis of traditional Islamic education systems and modern Islamic education in Indonesia" to be researched and studied in depth.

## **RESEARCH METHODS**

This research is library research, by analyzing books, journals and all sources related to the traditional Islamic education system and the modern Islamic education system in Indonesia. The focus of this research is a comparative analysis study of traditional Islamic education systems and modern Islamic education systems in Indonesia. Fokus tersebut dianalisis berdasarkan literatur yang ada tanpa memberikan analisis khusus. This focus is analyzed based on existing literature without providing a specific analysis. The focus of this research is to examine the traditional and modern Islamic education systems in Indonesia and analyze the comparison. The data collection technique used in this research is library research. The data collection technique in this research is that all data is collected through library research and all data is qualitative, namely disclosing the data through presentation (description), so in its management it is conducted and presents the nature of the data obtained and

then analyzed further to obtain conclusions. As a qualitative researcher, at the analysis stage there are at least three stages that go through in this research, namely data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing.

## **DISCUSSION AND RESULTS**

### **1. Traditional Islamic Education System in Indonesia**

Traditional Islamic education is an effort made by educators to educate, guide and direct students using old methods. Traditional Islamic Education is an educational institution that makes conscious and planned efforts to develop the potential of students by guiding, educating, developing and directing students according to Islamic teachings. Thus, traditional Islamic education is an activity carried out by educational institutions in a planned and systematic manner to develop students' abilities to achieve something planned. Traditional Islamic education is known as the halaqah education system, where students sit cross-legged in a circle around the kyai or teacher. This halaqah system does not use benches for sitting, tables for writing, does not use boards to provide material and the material studied is religious sciences.

Traditional Islamic education has very prominent characteristics, relying on religious knowledge which is a priority. This process was initially carried out in homes, khuttabas, salons, mosques. with the knowledge taught about religion. In the context of "Indonesian" Islam, there is the

term Islamic boarding school, a place where students gain religious knowledge. The development of educational institutions in this early period attempted to combine the "Indonesian" context with Islam. Then it developed into Islamic boarding schools in Indonesia. However, as time progressed, the modernization of Islamic education began to appear with the emergence of madrasa forms as a development of the Islamic boarding school education system. Traditional Islamic education, if viewed from the educational system, has its own characteristics, namely that it still uses the old system (halaqah) and has not had any changes in line with developments over time.

Islamic education in Indonesia emerged and developed in various forms of institutions, such as Islamic boarding schools, surau, and meunasah. Over time, the development of Islamic education in Indonesia has been marked by the gradual emergence of various educational institutions, ranging from simple ones to those considered modern and comprehensive. Islamic educational institutions have adapted their roles in accordance with societal demands and the evolving times.

The development of these educational institutions has attracted the attention of experts both from within the country and abroad to conduct scientific studies in conferences. Since then, there have been many research results from experts that have informed the growth and development of Islamic educational institutions. The aim is not only to enrich the treasures of knowledge with Islamic

nuances, but also to serve as reference and comparison material for managers of Islamic education in the future. This is in line with the principles generally adhered to by the Indonesian Islamic community, namely maintaining good past traditions and adopting new, even better traditions. In this way, efforts to develop Islamic educational institutions will not be radically removed from their cultural roots.

## **2. Modern Islamic Education System in Indonesia**

Modern Islamic education is education that is based on the concept of divinity but is universal. This means education that remains based on Islamic teachings as a whole but is able to position itself in the global modern world order in order to respond to the secularization of science and education which increasingly distances human life from religion. The concept of Islamic education based on divinity is a reform of Islamic education thinking, especially in Islamic education methods and curriculum. The purpose of Islamic education based on divinity is education based on faith in Allah SWT.

The new paradigms and methods of Islamic education referred to here are thoughts that must continuously be developed through education to reclaim science and technology education, but not forgetting religious education, as in the old golden age. Modern Islamic education does not only focus on religious teachings, but also integrates science and technology. Islam encourages its followers to seek knowledge and use it for the good of humanity.

It is hoped that this integration or combination of general knowledge with Islamic religious knowledge can bridge the two systems. So that both can play a complementary role with each other. In this case, integration aims to produce intellectual students or students. Education should not remain without change. Education must carry out paradigm construction/change as an effort to equip students for the life of their era and the era to come. The modern Islamic education system is known as classical education, an education system that uses facilities and infrastructure, namely using benches for sitting, using tables for writing, using boards and projectors to provide material.

In this information age and modern developments, whoever is able to control the world of information will be able to control the world. Students must be able to master the world of information, so that they are able to live and exist in their time. In connection with this, educational institutions should not only teach about *ulum al-din*, but should also teach about science and technology to answer the challenges of the times. Other principles in the new paradigm of Islamic education that want to be developed are: there is no dichotomy between science and religion; science is not free of value but free of value; teaches religion using the language of science and not only teaches the traditional side, but also the rational side.

The concept of modern education focuses more on aspects of students' lives, namely the continuous learning process which is influenced by conditions both inside and



outside the school. Education is also influenced by the abilities, learning situations and interests of students and whether teaching methods are effective or not. Education in modern society or a society that is moving towards modernity, such as Indonesian society, basically provides a link between students and their rapidly changing socio-cultural environment. The characteristics of modern education are curriculum development, teachers as facilitators, effective learning methods, use of media developments, learning places can be anywhere. Islamic educational institutions that are developing in this modern era include Madrasahs, Modern Islamic Boarding Schools, Integrated Islamic Schools and Islamic Boarding Schools.

### **3. Comparison of the Traditional Islamic Education System with the Modern Islamic Education System in Indonesia.**

#### **a. Comparison of Islamic education systems in the aspect of learning methods**

The education system in Islamic boarding schools is part of the internal structure of Islamic education in Indonesia which is held traditionally. Islamic boarding schools as Islamic educational institutions have several learning methods such as the Sorogan method, namely students individually with a teacher or also known as the individual method. Bandongan method, where a group of students sit in a circle listening to their teacher who reads,

translates, explains and often reviews Islamic and Arabic books. Tahfiz method and Muazakaroh method, which is one type of method applied in Islamic boarding schools. In general, the tahfiz method is used to memorize certain books and is also often used to memorize the Koran, either short letters or in its entirety.

The surau education system is a learning system that does not recognize levels or class levels, the differences between students are seen from their respective levels of knowledge, the learning process applied is also not rigid and they are given the freedom to choose which group the students want to study in. The learning method at the student surau does not use tables or blackboards, only the yellow book is the main source for learning.

The learning system at meunasah generally uses the classical halaqah (in a circle) learning method in accordance with the nature of meunasah as a traditional educational institution. Halaqah in its implementation, a teungku or kyai provides education in a sitting position in the middle, while the students (murib; aneuk miet beuët) surround the teungku. Apart from that, the method applied in delivering lesson material is the sorogan method, which is generally implemented in Islamic boarding schools, namely students study individually in front of the kyai.

Madrasas and public schools in order to prepare the pioneer generation to realize the above ideals. So we must pay attention to graduates who are qualified, qualified and have noble personalities who must be produced through the

educational process both in madrasas and public schools. To achieve this, strategies and learning methods are needed for ideal results. The methods applied by Madrasahs are the lecture method, practical method, quantum method, tourist study method, habituation method, discussion method, repetition (At-Tikrar) and gradual (Al-Tajrir) method, Targhib and Tarhib methods.

Modern Islamic boarding schools have experienced a very significant transformation both in their educational system, especially in their institutional elements, including management with very neat management and administration and their teaching system is implemented with equal portions between Islamic education and general education. Modern Islamic boarding schools aim to combine traditionality and modernity of education. The classical-style formal teaching system (teaching in the classroom) and the integrated curriculum are adopted with certain adjustments. The change in learning methods which were previously carried out individually or sorogan became a classical system which we later came to know as madrasa (school). Apart from still maintaining the traditions of religious knowledge and Arabic, it also maximized education on general knowledge. Modern learning methods (tajdid) are learning methods resulting from renewal among Islamic boarding schools by incorporating methods that have developed in today's society, although they are not followed by implementing modern systems, such as school or madrasa systems.

The concept of integrated Islamic school education is student-oriented and not subject-oriented. This integration is seen from the perspective of the rights of every student, as well as special children, to receive educational services, no different from other children. Integrated education is emphasized more as a learning process than teaching. Students are directed to have motivation to learn something that must be learned and continue learning. However, students are not forced to learn something they do not want to learn. The material studied is integrated. In such education, individual characteristics get a proper place. There are three possible variations of integrated learning relating to education carried out in a more progressive educational atmosphere, namely, integrated curriculum, integrated day and integrated learning.

The boarding school education system is a combination of the formal general education curriculum with non-formal education which is implemented in Islamic boarding schools/dayah with the study of the Turats books, the students also live in that place with planned and regular activities which are always carried out by the students during 24 hours. This boarding school education system is a combination of the public school education system and the Islamic boarding school education system where students receive education for 24 hours (full day school).

The advantages of boarding school education in increasing students' understanding can be done through daily programs, weekly programs and annual programs. Apart from

that, there are also strengthening efforts made to strengthen Islamic education learning through boarding school activities in the classroom and in the school and dormitory environment. This boarding school education model offers advantages that can be measured in terms of students' readiness to become people who believe and are devout and able to live independently in society. This education system also provides many opportunities to develop their personalities, for example through social activities, community service and sports activities. In this context, students can develop spiritual awareness and a deeper understanding of the Islamic religion. They are also trained to become responsible individuals and have a tolerant attitude towards differences. However, although the boarding school education system has the potential to increase students' understanding of Islamic religious education, other factors such as the quality of teaching, curriculum and teaching methods also need to be considered. In this case, it is important for educational institutions to ensure that all aspects of education, including religious education, are delivered well and effectively.

#### **b. Comparison of Islamic education systems in curriculum aspects**

In the context of education in Islamic boarding schools, the term curriculum is not well known, most Islamic boarding schools do not formulate the basics and objectives of Islamic boarding schools explicitly or

implement them in the form of a curriculum. The Islamic boarding school learning system still maintains its originality since it was first established, even if there are some changes, it is not much and does not change the original system, meaning that the Kyai remains the central and main reference in every policy that will be taken. So Islamic boarding schools do not yet have a syllabus or what is known as a curriculum.

Then the teaching curriculum in Surau education can be differentiated based on the level of education contained in it, including teaching the Al-Qur'an, teaching books and tarekat. Teaching the Koran is divided into two levels, namely lower level and upper level education. The lower level teaching curriculum includes understanding the spelling of the letters of the Koran, reading the Koran, how to perform ablution and prayer procedures and morals. The teaching curriculum at the upper level includes reading the Al-Qur'an with songs, qasidah, barzanji, recitation and scriptures. Then at the next level of education is teaching or reciting books. The teaching curriculum at this level of education includes sharaf science, nahwu science, fiqh science, tafsir science and other sciences related to Arabic. After students are able to pass the two levels of surau education above (teaching the Koran and teaching the book), then they can take part in tarekat education by studying the sciences of Sufism. The aspect of Sufism is the form of worship that is most liked by students at the surau. As a consequence, they like to read old Arabic books

of Sufism which are translated into Malay as part of their curriculum. Thus, the character from another aspect can be seen from the characteristics of the surau which functions as the center of the congregation and can be seen from the students who like Sufism.

The form of the Islamic education curriculum held at Meunasah cannot be understood as the curriculum in modern Islamic education institutions which contains components in the form of objectives, content, organization and strategy. The educational curriculum with all its components is difficult to determine in Islamic educational literature in the past, such as during the sultanates and kingdoms. Therefore, the Islamic education curriculum in meunasah in this paper is understood as the subject or scientific materials taught in an educational process. Related to the curriculum applied in basic education institutions are a number of basic subjects which generally apply to the lower education curriculum. The main material taught is usually the Koran, religion, reading, writing and poetry. Then, on several occasions, Nahwu subjects, stories and skills lessons are also given (meu'en branch, meu'en galah cak igeuet, boh awo, meu'en gaseng as games and to hone thinking skills).

The madrasa curriculum carries two major mandates, firstly equipping students with competencies and life skills so that they can then face the challenges of their time, secondly passing on cultural character and noble values to the nation's next generation so that the roles and functions of future generations cannot be separated from cultural roots, religious

values and noble values of the nation. To apply these two great mandates, the curriculum must always dynamically develop to answer the demands of the times. In general, the madrasa curriculum contains religious subjects which are divided into several subjects, such as Al-Qur'an-Hadist, Akidah-Akhlak, Jurisprudence, Islamic cultural history (SKI), and added with Arabic language lessons from MI to MA, so that the portion of Islamic religious education subjects is greater.

Then the development of the curriculum in modern Islamic boarding schools itself includes several components to be developed, including the development of objectives, carried out as an effort to serve as the basis or foundation for the implementation of education. Content/material development, in the development of the curriculum in modern Islamic boarding schools adopting the national curriculum as a step to include general subjects plus local content and self-development. Strategy development is carried out to determine teaching methodology and other strategies to achieve educational goals in Islamic boarding schools, while evaluation development is carried out to see to what extent the curriculum can be implemented. Curriculum development produces a positive impact on Islamic boarding schools. Such as improving the overall quality of Islamic boarding school education by strengthening learning materials by adopting standards and competencies in the national curriculum. The integration of the Islamic boarding school curriculum into the national curriculum aims to strengthen



lessons in Islamic boarding schools by complementing the lessons between those in the Islamic boarding school curriculum and the national curriculum in modern Islamic boarding schools. The integration of the curriculum is adaptive, namely the involvement of students to be innovative, creative, proactive and enthusiastic in implementing education. Then, inclusiveness means inviting students to be able to adapt when learning.

Meanwhile, the Integrated Islamic School is part of the educational ideology adopted from the Muslim Brotherhood. This can be seen in the ten concepts of *muwasafat* which are the goals of education held by the Integrated Islamic School. Specifically, the Integrated Islamic School curriculum is a curriculum that contains targets that must be achieved periodically at several levels, including youth, intermediate and adult levels. The form of curriculum at the Integrated Islamic School (SIT) is a design formulated and determined by the central management of the Integrated Islamic School Network (JSIT). The Integrated Islamic School has designed a curriculum that is able to integrate Islamic values into various non-Islamic/general religious education subjects, even indicators of student learning achievement are not only measured by the achievement of an academic competency, but the measure that is more emphasized is the extent to which students can committed to the actualization of the Islamic values that they have learned and are able to implement in everyday life. The integrated

Islamic school curriculum also integrates the national curriculum with the curriculum from the Ministry of Religion.

At the Islamic Boarding School, apart from the integrated education system, the form of curriculum applied is also integrated with the aim of balancing science and technology and science and technology. The curriculum content usually takes the form of subject names and activity names. The curriculum content is determined by the educational goals to be achieved. Islamic Boarding School uses the Ministry of National Education (SMA) curriculum and the Ministry of Religion (MA) curriculum which are enriched according to the vision and mission of certain educational institutions. This means that the systematic curriculum program is enriched with science and technology (science and technology strengthening program) and improving the quality of faith and piety (IPTAK). For this reason, there are additional face-to-face hours in the fields of mathematics, physics, chemistry, biology, Islamic religious education and Arabic. Regarding the curriculum, in general it is almost the same as other schools, only in schools such as madrasas that apply the boarding school system, Islamic religious education is more developed, such as SKI subjects, Arabic, fiqh, Aqidah and Qur'an hadith.

## **CONCLUSION**

Based on the analysis relating to "Comparison of Traditional Islamic Education Systems and Modern Islamic

Education Systems in Indonesia" the following conclusions can be drawn:

1. Traditional Islamic education in Indonesia is an effort made by educators to educate, guide and direct students using the halaqah system. Traditional Islamic education has very prominent characteristics, relying on religious knowledge as the main priority and this process was initially carried out in homes, salons and mosques with religious knowledge being taught. Traditional Islamic education has its own character, such as a focus on educational orientation as an effort to carry out sacred duties, preserve Islamic teachings, strengthen the doctrine of monotheism, emphasize Islamic knowledge, education that is centered on kyai and educational systems and methods that are still traditional. Traditional Islamic educational institutions that existed at that time, such as Islamic boarding schools, Surau and Meunasah, historically had their birth, functions and levels, each with their own stories and uniqueness.
2. Modern Islamic education is education that uses a classical system and is based on a universal concept of divinity. Modern Islamic education also does not only focus on religious teachings, but also integrates science and technology. It is hoped that this integration or combination of general knowledge with Islamic religious knowledge can bridge the two systems. Modernization contains thoughts, currents, movements and efforts to change understandings, customs, institutions, and so on,

so that they can be adapted to new opinions and circumstances that arise from the progress of modern science and technology. Thus, if we relate with Islamic education in the modern era experiencing a process of changing the curriculum, methods, methodology, situation and Islamic education from the traditional (orthodox) towards a more rational one. The characteristics of modern Islamic education are more transparent and accountable management as well as the availability of learning plans in the form of a clear curriculum and adequate facilities and infrastructure. Educational integration brings Islamic education into a new era with the transformation of Islamic educational institutions such as madrasas, modern Islamic boarding schools, integrated Islamic schools and Islamic boarding schools.

3. From the various sources and literature explored, similarities and differences can be found between the traditional Islamic education system and the modern Islamic education system in Indonesia which starts from a comparison of several aspects. In essence, the similarities between traditional and modern Islamic education can be interpreted as an effort to develop and guide human personality in accordance with Islamic values in society and culture. Meanwhile, the difference between the two lies in their status as Islamic Education Institutions, both in terms of the learning system, the

learning media used and the curriculum that applies therein.

## REFERENCES

- Abc Rachman, 2013, *Aliran Pemikiran Pendidikan Islam*, (Jakarta: PT. Raja Grafindo Persada)
- Abudin Nata, 2009, *Rekonstruksi Pendidikan Islam* (Jakarta; Rajawali Press)
- Abdullah Syukri Zarkasyi, 2005, *Gontor dan Pembaharuan Ajaran Islam*, (Jakarta: PT. Raja Grafindo Persada)
- Ansori, M. 2021, Pengembangan Kurikulum Madrasah Di Pesantren. *Munaddhomah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 1(1 SE-Articles)
- Abdul Mun'im Ibrahim, *Al-Bayan Syarbut Tibyan* (Cairo; Maktabah Aulad Al-Syaikh),
- Babun Suharto, 2014, *Managing Transitions: Tantangan dan Peluang PTAI di Abad Informasi* (Jember: STAIN Jember Press,)
- Badruzzaman Ismail, 2002 *Mesjid Dan Adat Meunasah Sebagai Sumber Budaya Aceh* (Majelis Pendidikan Daerah Provinsi NAD)
- Budiyono, A. 2021, Konsep Kurikulum Terintegrasi: Analisis Kurikulum Formal dengan Pesantren. *Ilmuna: Jurnal Studi Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 3(1 SE-)
- Dhofier, Z. 1994 *Tradisi Pesantren*. (Jakarta: LP3ES (Lembaga Penelitian, Pendidikan, dan Penerangan Ekonomi dan Sosial)

*Muhammad Aminullah, Bahaking Rama, Abbas Baco Miro, Tabhan Syamsu Rijal*

- Handayani, I. P., & Achadi, M. W. 2023, Integrasi Kurikulum Muhammadiyah Boarding School dan Implikasinya pada Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam di SMA Muhammadiyah. *Intelektual: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Studi Keislaman*, 12(3 SE-Articles)
- Imam Barnawi, 1993 *Tradisionalisme Dalam Pendidikan Islam*, (Surabaya: Al Ikhlas)
- Maksudin. 2010, *Pendidikan Islam Alternatif, Membangun Karakter Melalui Sistem Boarding School*. (Yogyakarta: UNY Press)
- Ramayulis, 2011 *Sejarah Pendidikan Islam; Perubahan Konsep, Filsafat dan Metodologi Dari Era Nabi SAW Sampai Ulama Nusantara*, (Jakarta: Kalam Mulia)
- Samsul Nizar, 2005, *Sejarah dan Pergolakan Pemikiran Islam*, (ciputat, Quantum Teaching)
- Suyanto, 2006, *Dinamika Pendidikan Nasional Dalam Percaturan Dunia Global*, (Jakarta: PSAS Muhammadiyah)
- THOHIR, Ajid. 2009. *Perkembangan Peradaban di Kawasan Dunia Islam*. RajaGrafindo Persada
- Trianto, 2012 *Model Pembelajaran Terpadu*, (Jakarta: PT Bumi Aksara)
- Yayan Rakhtikawati, 2021 *Islamic Boarding School, Sebuah Alternatif System Pendidikan Modern Berwawasan Kebangsaan*, (Bandung: Anggota IKAPI)